

**T.C.
ISTANBUL AYDIN UNIVERSITY
INSTITUTE OF GRADUATE STUDIES**



**FROM LOGOS TO “MIDDLE-EARTH”: THE MUSICAL THEORY IN
TOLKIENS SILMARILLION**

MASTER’S THESIS

Sara Hilal Sedeeq

**Department of English Language and Literature
English Language and Literature Program**

August, 2021

**T.C.
ISTANBUL AYDIN UNIVERSITY
INSTITUTE OF GRADUATE STUDIES**



**FROM LOGOS TO “MIDDLE-EARTH”: THE MUSICAL THEORY IN
TOLKIENS SILMARILLION**

MASTER’S THESIS

**Sara Hilal Sedeeq
(Y1712.130116)**

**Department of English Language and Literature
English Language and Literature Program**

Thesis Advisor: Assistant Professor Doctor Timuçin Buğra EDMAN

August, 2021

ONAY FORMU

DECLARATION

I hereby declare with respect that the study “From Logos To “Middle-Earth”: The Musical Theory In Tolkiens Silmarillion ”, which I submitted as a Master thesis, is written without any assistance in violation of scientific ethics and traditions in all the processes from the Project phase to the conclusion of the thesis and that the works I have benefited are from those shown in the Bibliography. (13/08/2021)

Sara Hilal Sedeeq

FOREWORD

This research focusses on J.R.R Tolkien's creation of an imaginary world called Middle-Earth. The forging of Middle-Earth is an extraordinary occurrence that happens through a musical war which includes many oppositions. The thesis will show how Tolkien composed a magical secondary world that has traces of the primary world. The main aspects that have been taken under consideration are Heraclitus' logos, Pythagoras' music of the sphere and a comparison between the Ainur and the Greek gods.

June 2021

Sara Sedeeq

FROM LOGOS TO “MIDDLE-EARTH”: THE MUSICAL THEORY IN TOLKIENS SILMARILLION

ABSTRACT

The creation process in various myths is one of the most fascinating of occurrences. The musical creation of *The Silmarillion* which constructs a preliminary sub creation of *The Lord of the Rings* will be the ‘Holy Bible’ of Middle-earth. J.R.R Tolkien designs his Middle-earth from the very beginning of everything as if he were implementing either the genesis part in the Holy Bible or the cosmogonic creation that is fantasized by Ovidius in his metamorphoses. In other words, Tolkien employs music as the primary element in *The Silmarillion* to explain how Middle-earth came to be. He employed music as the primary element of his creation, which requires close attention and a deeper examination of the process at work through this dissertation. This thesis examines the connection of the creation process of Middle-earth through two philosophical theories: Heraclitus’ logos and Pythagoras’ theory of music. Logos is a term that can be associated with many different meanings, including law, contradictions, understanding, and wisdom. On the other hand, music represents the primary element in the formation of the universe in Middle-earth. At the beginning, the Ainur (Valars) are playing a harmonic melody to create Middle-earth. Melkor, the antagonist, interrupts them with his harsh discord, which eventually leads to the link to Pythagoras and the music of the spheres. This link can be established because of the harmony that is being interrupted by Melkor. Harmony plays a major role in Pythagoras’ music of the spheres. In addition, it plays a major role in Heraclitus’ logos. For these reasons, the link between logos and the music of the spheres can be established. As a matter of fact, this thesis reports to make a connection among the musical creation, logos, and *The Silmarillion*, as well as a thoroughly comparison among the Ainur and the Greek gods to pinpoint Tolkien’s both inspiration and influence on the primary world and the sub creation and this comparison will be the last chapter of this thesis before the conclusion.

Keywords: *The Silmarillion*, Middle-earth, logos, Heraclitus' philosophy, Greek mythology, the music of the spheres, cosmogonic creation

LOGOLARDAN “ORTA DÜNYA”YA: TOLKIENS SILMARILLION'DA MÜZİK TEORİSİ

ÖZET

Çeşitli limitlerdeki yaratılış süreci, olayların en büyüleyicilerinden biridir. Yüzüklerin Efendisi'nin ön alt yapımını oluşturan Silmarillion'un müzikal eseri, Orta Dünya'nın 'Kutsal İncil'i olacak. J.R.R Tolkien, Orta Dünya'sını her şeyin en başından, sanki ya Kutsal Kitap'taki oluşum kısmını ya da Ovidius'un metamorfozlarında hayal ettiği kozmogonik yaratılışı uyguluyormuş gibi tasarlar. Başka bir deyişle, Tolkien, Orta Dünya'nın nasıl ortaya çıktığını açıklamak için Silmarillion'daki anahtar birim olarak müziği kullanır ve bu, bu tez aracılığıyla işleyen sürecin yakından incelenmesini ve daha derin bir incelemesini gerektirir. Bu tez, Orta Dünya'nın yaratılış sürecinin bağlantısını iki felsefi teori üzerinden incelemektedir: Herakleitos'un logos'u ve Pisagor'un müzik teorisi. Logos, hukuk, çelişkiler, anlayış ve bilgelik gibi birçok farklı anlamla ilişkilendirilebilen bir terimdir. Öte yandan müzik, Orta Dünya'da evrenin oluşumunda temel faktörü temsil eder. Başlangıçta, Ainur (Valar) Orta Dünya'yı yaratmak için armonik bir melodi çalıyor. Antagonist Melkor, onları sert uyumsuzluğuyla keser ve bu da sonunda Pisagor ve kürelerin müziği ile bağlantıya yol açar. Bu bağlantı, Melkor tarafından kesintiye uğratılan uyum nedeniyle kurulabilir. Dostluk, Pisagor'un küreler müziğinde önemli bir rol oynar. Ayrıca Herakleitos'un logolarında geniş bir tasviri vardır. Bu nedenlerle logos ile kürelerin müziği arasında bağlantı kurulabilir. Nitekim bu tez, müzikal yaratılış, logos ve Silmarillion arasında bir bağlantı kurmanın yanı sıra Ainur ve Yunan tanrıları arasında kapsamlı bir karşılaştırma yaparak Tolkien'in birincil dünya ve dünya üzerindeki hem ilhamını hem de etkisini saptamak için rapor etmektedir. alt oluşturma ve bu karşılaştırma, bu tezin sonuç bölümünden önceki son bölümü olacaktır.

Anahtar Kelimeler: Silmarillion, Orta Dünya, logos, Herakleitos felsefesi, Yunan mitolojisi, kürelerin müziği, kozmogonik yaratılış

TABLE OF CONTENT

FOREWORD	ii
ABSTRACT	iii
ÖZET	v
TABLE OF CONTENT	vii
I. INTRODUCTION	1
II. DECIPHERING LOGOS	5
III. PYTHAGORAS AND MUSIC	13
IV. THE MUSICAL CREATION OF MIDDLE-EARTH	22
V. COMPARISON AND CONTRAST OF THE AINUR WITH THE GREEK GODS	30
VI. CONCLUSION	43
VII. REFERENCES	48

I. INTRODUCTION

This thesis will examine Tolkien's *The Silmarillion* including the creation of Middle-earth. One of the aims of this thesis is to show how logos influences the formation of Middle-earth, and this formation will shed light on the relationship between music and forging of this world from a philosophical perspective, as well as their respective roles in Tolkien's imagination of *The Silmarillion*. As this thesis will look at the creation process through both cosmogonic and musical theory, a comparison between the similarities and differences of Ainur and the Greek gods is also a part of it, which will be the next aim of this thesis. The thesis consists of four different chapters, with each chapter individually examining unique perspectives under the microscope to bring clarity and connect them by the end of the study. The thesis also aims to show how two philosophical elements, namely, logos and the music of the spheres are combined to create an alternative world called Middle-earth, and to demonstrate to what extent the creation of Middle-earth was influenced by Greek mythology from its conception. Then finally this thesis will try to confirm the idea that logos exists in different forms and even though Tolkien was influenced by Greek mythology, Greek cosmogonic making of mankind and musical theory as Tolkien also describes in his writings, his world is a mere sub creation that is a world that resembles this primary world we live in, but still with many differences.

The creator of Middle-earth is John Ronald Reuel Tolkien, who sought to generate a world united by logos and created by music. J.R.R. Tolkien was born in 1892 in Bloemfontein, South Africa. After his father died when he was four years of age, a fatherless Tolkien moved to Birmingham, England. His mother passed away in 1904, leaving him an orphan. He attended King Edward's School in Birmingham and Exeter College in Oxford. Tolkien received his bachelor's degree in 1915 and his masters' degree in 1919. During most of his career he was a teacher. He taught English language and literature at the University of Leeds from 1920 – 1925, and at Oxford University from 1925 – 1959. His field of expertise was old and middle English. Tolkien was active in the academic field, where he composed a few

prominent intellectual writings. In addition to his academic career, Tolkien spent his time writing fantasy stories set in a world he had imagined (Middle-earth). Tolkien lived through two world wars. Through these occurrences, he blended his imagination with his experiences, so his stories came to life, and his books became highly popular. He is the author of *The Hobbit* and *The Lord of the Rings*. Tolkien wrote *The Silmarillion* between the two world wars and died before publishing it. Tolkien's son published it after his father's death. *The Silmarillion* is a unique piece of work, not only because it presents an entirely new fictional world, which is considered mythology but also for the vivid imagery that show how the primary and the secondary world are merged.

In this thesis the existence of Heraclitus' logos combined with Pythagoras' theory of music of the spheres within Middle-earth, and the significance of the effect of logos on the conception of Middle-earth in Tolkien's groundbreaking novel *The Silmarillion* will be elaborated. Meanwhile the similarities as well as the differences between the Ainur and the Greek gods will be displayed. Many views consider the process of creation, which has different explanations throughout modern religion, science, and mythology. Taking a closer look at the creation of a fictional world called "Middle-earth," with consideration of philosophical aspects, will show how logos and music play significant roles in Tolkien's creation of Middle-earth in *The Silmarillion*.

The creation of Middle-earth occurred in a very different manner from the making of the real world. Music and opposition played immense roles in this process of creation. The forming of Middle-earth took place through an argument, a musical argument, where light played against the dark. In this case, the light is Ilúvatar, the father of all, who is also called Eru, and the Ainur, who are the holy ones and are the first beings created by Ilúvatar. The Ainur play their music under the order of Ilúvatar. The dark one is Melkor, the great rebellious Vala who used to be the mightiest of the Ainur; he is the evil-spirited Ainur. Melkor's interruption creates a world that is even more beautiful than what the Ainur had imagined. His chaos and his bold, harsh tones make the Ainur play more beautifully and put all of their strength into their music to fight the darkness that emanates from Melkor's music. To support this point Mark Worthing states, "In Tolkien's account of creation Eru, called by the elves Illuvatar, which means 'the God who is,' forms the Ainur, the

holy ones who are the offspring of his thought. Illuvatar declared to the Ainur a great theme and bid them unfold it with music, which they begin with great beauty” (Worthing, 2016, p. 63). As Mark Worthing also states the discord spread and threatened the harmony in this musical opposition. It is a natural fact as Tolkien reveals in his part of discord by juxtaposing two oppositions or two forces simultaneously. In a similar context Ovidious explains how the dark and the light, death and life, coincided within each other to form the universe (Ovid & Humphries, 1971). The following lines will illustrate the contradictions that are needed for a new life to begin:

‘[Y]es, I am white now,’ said Gandalf. ‘Indeed I am Saruman, one might almost say, Saruman as he should have been. But come now, tell me of yourselves! I have passed through fire and deep water, since we parted. I have forgotten much that I thought I knew, and learned again much that I had forgotten. I can see many things far off, but many things that are close at hand I cannot see. Tell me of yourselves!’ (Tolkien, 2004, p. 495)

Similarly, Anaximander contends that one single element cannot be the source of everything, and for this reason, numerous differences and patterns are found in nature. He believes the cosmos was created through the oppositions of the four elements. He also believes that those oppositions maintain the balance and harmony of the universe. Heraclitus’ view toward oppositions is akin to that of Anaximander. He believes that one can reach reality only by understanding the harmony of oppositions. Every time when two different elements come in contact with each other, one's existence is related to the others end. In other words, as two forces come together, their clash creates another form. (Seligman, 1975, p.123)

Oppositions or contradictions are referred to as logos by the Greek philosopher Heraclitus (New World Encyclopedia Contributors, 2018). The search for the existence and the meaning of logos is one of this thesis’s primary points of emphasis as mentioned before. The other point of emphasis is music and Pythagoras’ theory about music. Since the creation of Middle-earth begins through music, Pythagoras’ theory about the music of the spheres is a fitting match in determining how music plays a major role in the harmony of the universe, particularly in *The*

Silmarillion. According to Pythagoras' belief, the entire universe has its own music, and this music is in harmony (Proust, 2009). The harmony to which Pythagoras refers can be connected to logos, whereas chaos creates harmony. The last point is to show the similarities and differences between the Ainur and the Greek gods with the aim of confirming that Greek mythology influenced the creation of Middle-earth. Consequently, contradictions and music will come together in this paper in analyzing the formation of an imaginary world by J.R.R Tolkien. Different meanings attached to logos will be examined and analyzed, with the intention of finding the most fitting meaning that can be identified in the creation of Tolkien's Middle-earth. A link will be established between logos and music to show how these two different aspects can be connected in an attempt to create something new, or a sub creation, in Tolkien's words "something similar to the primary world but still different". (Tolkien, "On Fairy Stories",) A new universe, a new land, which is influenced by Greek mythology and the Gods, and also new inhabitants, will be created in The *Silmarillion*, where the cosmos can be explained within the music of the spheres. Harmony versus chaos, and light versus dark, two entirely different realms, eventually give birth to one fictional world that is united: *The Silmarillion's* Middle-earth.

II. DECIPHERING LOGOS

This chapter examines the meaning of logos, and what logos in fact is, a concept much like a paradox. A paradox has the intention of unfolding intellectual depth rather than dissipating depth. There is no fixed meaning of logos, but there are many different meanings of logos that have been circulating from Pythagoras' ancient Greece to current times. "Logos is the term used to describe the capacity the work offers to improve" (Schiappa, 2013, p. 42). According to [dictionary.com](http://www.dictionary.com/) "<http://www.dictionary.com/>" the word logos comes from pre-Socratic philosophy (*Logos*). Logos can mean a word, a saying, speech, discourse, thought, proportion, ratio, reckoning, and, akin to *légein*, to choose, to gather, to recount, to tell over, or to speak. In philosophy, logos means logic, or judicious fundamentals: words and things, debates, or vindications. It embodies the origin of the cosmic structure. The etymology of logos goes back to the verb *légein*, which is the base for the noun logos. First, it means to pick up and lay down or lay by, which means to collect, count up, to tell, to recount, and to give an account. In the philosophical realm, logos has a deeper meaning than that mentioned in its etymology (Journal of the Indian Council of Philosophical Research, 2001). On the other hand, Socrates utilizes the difference between *légein* and logos through "[t]he scarcity of all these terms testifies to their novelty, particularly in light of Socrates' preferred use of logos and *légein* to describe what he was teaching" (Schiappa, 2013, p. 43). The Memphite theology/philosophy mentions that logos is the prehistoric foundation of the universe's evolution through speech, which represents the foundation of intelligibility, illumination, and reason. In context, logos can have all of the following meanings: thought, creative strength, creative speech, order, and form. The united strength of fire and logos is one of examples of the multiple usages of logos in the fields of development and restoration (Ashby, 2011, p. 50-75). According to Heraclitan and Stoic philosophies, it would be impossible to reconstruct and change the universe without mixing logos and fire cooperatively. The universal foundation of certainty, logic, and consciousness, which consists of all things to be created, is

logos. A human should adhere himself completely to the natural law; nature/creation itself being comprehensive; from the One. At the center of all things was the universal concept, the “creative fire” or Word known as LOGOS, which was closely tied to fate” (Janssen, 2020, p.16). The interweaving of logos and fire ensures the world is always evolving. The explanation above shows that logos is given precedence above all else. The ancient Greek philosophers held the belief that anything logical and hypothetical is held to a higher degree than anything sensual or real. This phrase means that the ancients held thoughts above actions. This brought forward ‘two realm cosmology’ which can be seen in Parmenidean metaphysics (Palmer 2020). ‘Two realm cosmology,’ as seen in Parmenides and Plato, gives preference to reason over a sense of perception (Tymieniecka, 2006, p. 333-343) The afore-mentioned definitions confirm how logos is widely associated with the creative process, and relates to fire, as well as their mixture in unison would form the basis or foundation of the creation and reconstruction of the universe. Even the progress of the universe depends on logos and the element of fire as mentioned. Logos is frequently used and clarified by Heraclitus (Kirk, 1975, p. 18). Heraclitus is a Greek philosopher; born around 540 BC in Ephesus/ Anatolia, which is known as Selcuk, Turkey today. He is known for his cosmology theories, which posit that fire creates the main component of a universe in order. Fire is also frequently mentioned by Heraclitus, and he regards it as the element of elements. (The Editors of Encyclopedia Britannica, 2019a) Logos not only relates to creation, but, as mentioned above, it has many different meanings and facets. From this, it is safe to say that logos takes on different forms, meanings, and aspects.

Coming back to Heraclitus, one idea he emphasizes is that people should live in social harmony, which means that harmony is an essential component for him as logos also means reason in Greek. Heraclitus complains about the misunderstanding of people toward logos. In his view, fire is the component that unites everything. Heraclitus states that the world's order is an “ever-living fire kindling in measures and being extinguished in measures.” He also includes ether, which is in the atmosphere and is highly volatile. According to Heraclitus, when it rains, ether falls with the rain and becomes part of the ocean. Fire and water are contradictory and technically are two opposing elements, through which the world holds an equilibrium (The Editors of Encyclopedia Britannica, 2019b).

Since early times in human history, there has not been a fixed definition for logos. Throughout history, the unknown has always been fascinating, and it draws human curiosity. Logos incorporates the same concept as God, which cannot be defined or questioned. In that sense, Heraclitus' discourse aims to draw sentient attention to better understand the language, not only the manifestation in the material world. Logos as a language, with its double meaning, connects to the material world, where the interpreter must find the hidden meanings. It is the first fragment that is concomitant with the material world (Reames, 2013, p. 328-350). In this respect, logos is found in the spiritual and the materialistic world. It is like a shapeshifter that assumes different forms where needed. It doesn't have only one definition or one meaning. Tolkien acknowledged a completely new approach towards words, he started to see them not only as a fragment of a language, but as a division of logos, essential to the way it is in the primary world (Flieger, 2002, p. 39). The oppositions of light and dark in *The Silmarillion* that describe the physical and spiritual phenomenon of Middle-earth is depicted in Tolkien's created languages. Hence, Tolkien connected light and language with each other. The shift from light to lights bears colors and diversity to his imaginary world, the same as the deviation from 'Word (logos)' to words (Flieger, 2002, p. 70).

The meaning of logos depends on different aspects that need to be understood, not merely known. Only knowing those aspects is not enough. Rather, one has to understand the aspects to be able to understand the meaning of logos. The sense of logos is primarily based on understanding, not only defining, the term. From a metaphysical perspective, logos means reason and divine mind/eternal fire. The interpretation of logos differs based upon the context in which it is used. Logos can mean so many different things at once. For example, it can mean oppositions of elements and harmony at the same time, as Illuvatar let all sub deities to perform their own actions and carry on their plans. There is a luminous discrepancy between Illuvatar and the Ainur which is important in Tolkien's Middle-earth. There is only one elite creator in Middle-earth which is Illuvatar. He is the one. The Ainur, are secondary creators. They take part in the substantial forming of the world, but they would not be able to if they would not have received the theme from Illuvatar (Flieger, 2002, p.55). In a letter to Peter Hastings, Tolkien asserts that "the whole matter from beginning to end is mainly concerned with the relation of Creation to

making and sub-creation" (Carpenter & Tolkien, 1981, p.188). To give an example Melkor has the freedom of composing his evil creatures as the way he wants. Shelob, who has an ancestral connection with the first demonic spider: the great spider that "lived between the first and the fourth age, akin to those of Nan Dungortheb. Somehow Shelob escaped the ruin of Beleriand, and she and her offspring dwelt in the Ephel Dúath and in Mirkwood. Shelob herself had a vast den in Cirith Ungol, and for two ages of Middle-earth she lived on Men, Elves and Orcs and served as a sure guard to prevent anyone from entering Mordor by that route" was one of the creatures that Melkor crafted in the very beginning of Middle-earth (Foster, 2001, p. 446-447). The very connection of the spider's logos cannot be only associated with evil things. In fact, when Tolkien was just a child in South Africa, before moving to England he was bitten by a giant spider and it was an unforgettable memory for him: "...[w]hen Ronald was beginning to walk, he stumbled on a Tarantula. It bit him, and he ran in terror across the garden until the nurse snatched him up and sucked out the poison." Therefore, in his *The Lord of the Rings and The Silmarillion* we see characters such as Frodo Baggins in *The Lord of the Rings*, who has arachnophobia like Tolkien had. Just like Tolkien himself, Frodo was bitten by a giant tarantula, namely Shelob. This is a typical sub creation of Tolkien's fictional world, namely Middle-earth in *The Silmarillion* which is quite different from the primary world that we live in but still recognizable through Tolkien's memories (Carpenter & Tolkien, 1981, p. 264). Tolkien was influenced by Owen Barfield and his theory about myth, language and humanity. His theory includes that myth, language and humanities understanding of the universe are connected and integral. Words used to be combined into one that would express all meaning and the compelling function, but to be able to comprehend the universe, humans needed an approach to analyze definite things. Consequently, the interpretation of words was splintered to extricate amidst objects. Those words later on form a man's view of the universe, and those splintered words modify the nuance. Tolkien used this theory to illustrate the concept of myth-making. The forging of a myth is characterized as design of sub-creation. This implies the formation of a secondary world with traces of the primary world forged by the Creator, or God. The magic of words is used to forge a secondary world. Tolkien viewed the universe as splintered light which is scattered, or re-formed by the sub-creator throughout the forming of a secondary world to divulge a reality about the primary world (Flieger, 2002, p.33-44).

There is another link to be established to understand the varied meaning of logos. It has an analogous connection with the concept of law in Greek philosophy, which is referred to as nomos. The relationship between logos and nomos should be clarified. Nomos does not completely correspond with the meaning of logos, but it bonds with it through similarity. In this sense, logos and nomos are not identical, but they are similar to each other like in the case of Tolkien's primary and secondary world. Since nomos means law in ancient Greek, human laws are cultivated by the divine universal law; they align with logos, which is the method for building the cosmos. In *The Silmarillion* we can see that the very first law of Illuvatar in the universe is the musical rhyme and the discord later occurs. It is possible to suggest that as in the primary world there are laws, law keepers, and lawbreakers. From that perspective, while the sub gods except Melkor are the law keepers, Melkor is the law breaker. The following lines of *The Silmarillion* are an example of Melkor being the lawbreaker, where he breaks the tranquility of the music of the Ainur: "...the discord of Melkor rose in uproar and contended with it, and again there was a war of sound more violent than before, until many of the Ainur were dismayed and sang no longer, and Melkor had the mastery (Tolkien, 1999, p. 5). Coming back to the discussion, Heraclitus also has something to say on this issue. Heraclitus does not imply that everyone knows nomos or that logos is a form of nomos. He hints that the ones who speak grow stronger by what is known, in the same way that the polis (city in Greek) is more potent because of its laws. This can be analyzed as follows: logos is a form of understanding that requires specific rules to be promulgated. For logos to fully function, it needs to have a set of rules that gather all of the needed conditions to reach logos' existence (Reames, 2013, p. 328-350).

The cosmos is the world that is looked upon as harmonic and well organized, where everything fits together like puzzle pieces. Heraclitus defines the cosmos as something that is not gathered externally by gas, but it is held together internally. Furthermore, thick and thin do not overmaster the changes of the cosmos. Cosmos is the universe, and it is in harmony, where all of the elements that are in a universe fit together to reach this kind of unity. Even though certain contradictions can be found throughout the universe, Heraclitus posits those contradictions are a prominent part of logos. All of these elements and contradictions are being held together and united to form one universe (Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, 2019). Logos can also

mean the things that we hear and the words that we utter in return. We hear logos, and we speak logos. In this case, logos can be regarded as a faithful listener and speaker. In *The Silmarillion* it is possible to see nature as a receptor as well, it listens to the sub gods including Melkor and follows their orders and changes its shape according to the sub gods designs. The following lines are an Illustration to display how nature changes its shape by listening to the Ainur and Melkor:

“[T]he Valar depart west across the Freat Sea and build a new home in the Land of Aman. On the shores of Aman they raise the Pelóri, the highest mountains on Earth, and on top of their highest peak Manwë sets his throne so that he and Varda can look out upon the whole Earth. Behind the mountain ramparts the Valar build their new home, Valinor, and it exceeds their original creation in Middle-earth because all living things and even stone and water are hallowed by the Valar, the Deathless. Upon a green mound in their new city, watered by the tears of Nienna and nourished by the song of Yavanna, two saplings arise and grow to become the Two Trees of Valinor: Telperion, whose dark green leaves gave off a silver light, Laurelin, with young green leaves

glittering gold. The waxing and waning of the Two Trees occur in a twelve-hour cycle, and thus begins the Count of Time on Earth during the days of the Bliss of Valinor” (Synyder, 2013, p. 184-185).

In another sense, logos can also mean a bond, where it ties two different things to each other without actually combining them. This means that those two things still have their own meaning in addition to being merged by logos, like the fellowship of the rings in *The Lord of the Rings* where different races such as Elves, Dwarves, Numenorians and men as well as sorcerers merged together on a single cause: sent the ring that controls all the other rings back to Mount Doom. Logos can also mean wisdom, something wise that has an epigram. It can also be interpreted as a fastidious moral rule, which accompanies everything through everything. This is because logos is both a speaker and a listener, and at the same time, it is a link. Logos can be represented as the link between understanding. For example, if logos is the speaker, in this case, it is the utterance, and logos, as a listener, is the message that is received through the utterance. Those two things are linked or united by logos, which is the listener’s understanding of what the speaker said, and this can be a kind of wisdom that Illuvatar can hear, see, and control everything but left the rest to the

Ainur.

As mentioned in the previous part of this chapter, Heraclitus implies that logos means fire, or that one of the meanings for logos is fire, and with that, he means all forms of fire. Even Aristotle states that fire is Heraclitus' ruling principle. One of Heraclitus' paradoxes is that fire is the source of life and death; fire discerns, determines, and eliminates everything. Fire also plays a significant role in *The Silmarillion* and the creation process in it. In *The Lord of the Rings* trilogy, and in *The Silmarillion*, there are two types of fire: the white fire and the destructive fire. As an example, to the destructive fire, Melkor stood for heats and fire where he controlled heats and fire throughout Middle-earth (Tolkien, 1999, p. 268). What is more the Balrogs, other evil creations of Melkor were also very dangerous ones:

“The meaning of their name was ‘power-terror’ or ‘demon of might.’⁴¹⁹ They were coming from the Maiar, the less powerful Valars who chose to enter the Earth with the rest of the Valar. They serve for the fire since “[t]hey were spirits of fire and bore whips of flame, but they were also cloaked in darkness” (Foster, 2001, p. 39).

In the Mountain of Fire in the Land of Shadow, where Sauron was wearing the One Ring, he was able to recognize all the things that have been made by the weaker rings. He also could see and administer the thinking of who wore the rings (Tolkien, 1999, p. 344). On the contrary, in *The Lord of the Rings* series we have examples for the white fire ‘the flame of Anor’, which means the positive power, “I am a servant of the Secret Fire, wielder of the flame of Anor. You cannot pass. The dark fire will not avail you, flame of Udûn. Go back to the Shadow! You cannot pass” (Tolkien, 2004, p. 330).

Fire is eternal because it is made out of the divine logos, which can mean that logos and fire are interchangeable or united together. The fire functions are as follows: visible fire unfolds on the setting spectacularly and dies with the same means as it controls all other transformations of the elements. In addition, there is an eternal fire that never extinguishes, and this fire exists within the cosmos. Its nature – which discerns, determines and eliminates – makes it the middle ground for cosmic exchanges. So, the destructive ability of fire brings about the change in everything. It is a significant matter in all material things, their mathematical second nature, and their adaptations and elemental alternation abilities. Fire allows logos to send a

specific, comprehensible message to the cosmos, which is expressed in numeric ratios. Fire exists in multiple forms in the universe, and this may be the reason why Heraclitus thinks of it as the primary source of creation. (Butler-Bowdon, 2013, p. 113) Logos is the thing that gathers everything together, out of everything one and out of one everything, which can be interpreted to mean that logos is the leading source in the creation of every matter and everything. As previously mentioned, logos also means contradictions; the oppositions of two pairs are gathered together by force.

Heraclitus defines harmony as a strongly factitious complex that has implicit actions and reactions; it is not a contemplative, gentle or picture-perfect lyrical combination. In this case, logos can also mean magnitude or ratio, a ratio that is a sort of connection regarding two magnitudes that are from the same source. Simultaneously, the oppositions that are gathered together by logos move into a state that is defined as Harmonia. Logos and Harmonia go hand in hand; this means that everything united is in a state of harmony because, due to their differences, everything is needed together. The differences or contradictions are not separating the elements or pieces of the universe, but instead connect them simultaneously to reach unity and a harmonious state. This is only possible because the oppositions complete each other to reach this harmonic state. As a matter of fact, when Melkor dies or sent to the void as an eternal pain within the abyss, one of his servants, Sauron reigns the throne to maintain the never-ending oppositions between good and evil in *The Silmarillion*.

III. PYTHAGORAS AND MUSIC

Having discussed the possible meanings of logos and all these meanings intertwine with the Silmarillion, this chapter will examine music and Pythagoras' theory of the music of the spheres. In addition, this chapter will also give some examples about music in a scientific aspect. Pythagoras is one of the oldest Greek philosophers who is interested in music, harmony, and ratios. He believes that we are surrounded by music, and that every planet has its independent music. Tolkien, in his Silmarillion, invented the universe and the peculiar languages more or less in a musical harmony that reflects some of the natural features of both the universe and the races in The Silmarillion. To give an example when we look at the languages of the Orcs and cave Trolls, the language that they utilize is very rough, tough and dark in rhyme and intonation. On the other hand, when we look at the language of the Elves it is very soft and mild. It has taken Tolkien about 12 years to finish writing Lord of the Rings. Tolkien's extraordinary work is nothing like traditional science fiction or fantasy novels. For this reason, putting his work under a certain category would be shapeless whereas you can find different genres embedded within his work. Such as, epic novel, fantastic novel, postcolonial novel, or a postmodern work if the reader has the intention to look at The Lord of the Rings from those point of views. In addition to his work being extraordinary, the different races that exist in the book such as Orcs, Elves, Ents, the Dwarves, etc. have their own languages and alphabets that are designed by Tolkien himself. He synchronically combined old languages with his created languages which as a result are like music to the ears of the listener, where he/she cannot distinguish the difference between various themes. Besides only creating Imaginary languages for those races, Tolkien has combined each race and languages through mirroring the cultural, traditional, and mythological variations of each of those races. For example, the intonation of the Orcs, reflects their rude and dark character. As a child, Tolkien began to invent languages as a hobby, but he eventually realized that a language cannot exist if there are no people to speak it. He realized that if a language was part of a cultural background, then language could not

only help the people who speak it express themselves but also guide those individuals in the development of their character and identity. Tolkien mentioned on multiple occasions that his created world and its cultures serve as a background for the languages he invented and that there can be no culture without a myth that advises and forms it. Consequently, it forms a full circle where the ‘inner consistency of reality’ is one where myth, language, and culture mirror one another and form the world that gives them life (Flieger, 2002, p. 61).

As it has been explained and stated many times, the process of forming the universe is entangled with the orchestra that Iluvatar crafted. The crafting of Middle-earth starts with the universal myth of the music of the Ainur, where the powers of Iluvatar and the Ainur are exposed. The Ainur can be considered as angelic powers, who have the authority within their spectrum of ruling. They are celestial, which means they existed before the forging of the world. Their strength and perceptions are obtained from their wisdom of the universal play, which can be regarded as a story written by some-one else, and later on viewed as ‘reality’. On the facet of a pure anecdotal tool, this is meant to provide beings of an equivalent structure of beauty, strength, and majesty like the 'Gods' of superior mythology, which might however be approved either well or bad by an intellect who believes in the Blessed Trinity (Carpenter & Tolkien, 1981, p. 146). More or less, a similar hypothesis was put into Greek academia by Pythagoras long ago. To understand his point, it would be better to be involved in Pythagoras’ ‘story’.

Pythagoras was born around 570 BCE in Samos, Ionia, Greece. He was a Greek philosopher, mathematician, and the founder of the Brotherhood of Pythagoreans. Their moral rules and beliefs credited the thoughts of Plato and Aristotle. They also affected mathematics and western philosophy. However, Pythagoras has always been acknowledged for his operational intent theory of numbers in the existential world and music. The majority of the intellectual heritage that arose from Pythagoras belonged to mystical wisdom rather than scientific scholarship (The Editors of Encyclopedia Britannica, 2021). Throughout history, mathematics and music have been closely associated, although, in its institutional and sociological history, music is distinguished from the other arts because of its historical closeness to philosophy (Zoeller, 1991). Many links between science and music date back to the 17th century. The shift of music from science to art and the

movement of science from theoretical to practical was the turning point in the 17th century. Furthermore, in the 19th and 20th centuries, the expansion of music science connected to mathematics and composition protracted the link between the two fields. In 1570, John Dee, an English/Welsh mathematician, astronomer, astrologer, and occult philosopher, and an advisor to Queen Elizabeth I, stated: “Musicke I here call that science, which of the Greeks is called Harmonie... Musicke is a Mathematical Science, which teacheth, by sense and reason, perfectly to judge, and order the diversities of sounds hie and low” (Fauvel, Flood and Wilson, 2006, p. 1). The reason why John Dee and Pythagoras link music to mathematics is to be able to play a tone with specific frequencies and vibrations. Moreover, mathematics plays a significant role in measuring those frequencies and vibrations. Without mathematics, the division of the musical notes and octaves would not be possible. Also, the measuring of the intervals significantly relies on mathematics.

A state of harmony cannot be reached without considering the frequencies and vibration of the musical tones and their intervals. So, before music was considered an art, it was considered a part of science. The science of music is a field that has been studied since ancient philosophy, and Pythagoras is the philosopher who shed light on it. John Dee stated that even though the Greeks called music harmony, in his view, music is a mathematical science that comes together through sense and reason. Music can be judged through the diversities of high and low sounds, leading to Pythagoras’ theory of the musical ratios. After the finding of the musical intervals, Pythagoras believed that they depended on numerical ratios, and through his connection, he assumed that the planets were round in shape (Bennett, 1945). The very beginning of the western concept starts with the interest in music from a philosophical standpoint. This dates back to the 6th century, where Pythagoras emphasized the mathematical basis of musical intervals, through which he categorizes music as an act of the intellect. He even goes further with his theory and suggests that the movement of the empyreans created music. This music cannot be heard by the human ear but was present in philosophical meditation. During medieval times, music was put to the quadrivium, which was the same group that oversaw arithmetic, geometry, and astrology. Music was detached from the mechanical arts, such as painting and sculpture. Music was regarded as one of the seven free or liberal arts (*artes liberales*) where the quadrivium was a part of them

(Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, 2018). Even nowadays, music is used as a sort of therapy, and the change in frequency can affect the human brain. One of the examples that can be considered is binaural beats, which have a particular frequency that affects the brain. Some beats help concentration, and others help listeners to sleep better. This means that each sort of frequency or, to phrase it better, every length and combination affects the human brain in a different matter. Pythagoras explained this many years ago, and this kind of therapy is used in the modern age.

Going back to one of Pythagoras' significant theories, "the music of the spheres," he believes that the planets have their music, and that all of their movements create specific vibrations which are harmonic and musical. This is a crucial point in this thesis, because the creation of Middle-earth ensues throughout music. Centuries later, modern scientists started to prove that the planets had their own independent music. One of the scientists was Johannes Kepler. Kepler was a German astronomer, mathematician, and astrologer. He devised the laws of planetary motion, which later was the primary source for Newton and his laws. Kepler regarded those rules as the harmonic movements of the planets, which echoed God's architecture of the universe (Westman, 2021). Kepler considered geometry as one of the most vital sciences related to musical harmony in explaining the design of the universe. Ancient Greek history referred to music as a mathematical science, and that music played a significant role in the order of the universe (Fauvel, Flood and Wilson, 2006, p. 29).

In December 2002, "NASA's Cassini Space probe picked up an eerie melody as it approached Jupiter. Cassini picked up low-frequency sounds that, when converted into audible waves, suggested the strains of some alien folk tune". Some scientists call the sounds that come from planet earth as "tweaks, whistles, and sferics" (Flow Motion, 2006). This current knowledge supports the hypothesis that the cosmos crafts its own music. Each planet has a different sound, and according to Pythagorean thought, the sounds differ from each other in terms of size, distance, and the velocity of their movement toward the listener (Herman, 2004, p.101). Such a placement maybe corresponded with how Illuvatar distributed different instruments to different Ainur, as if the Pythagorean idea purported that the sounds differ from each other in terms of 'size, distance, and velocity.' Since all those Ainur stood at a particular place in the void. Although the planets and the universe have their own

independent music, humans cannot hear it. Levenson's explanation to that is as follows, "Humanity could not hear the sound, for the simple reason that it never varied and never ceased" (Blackstone, 2011). In this case, it means that the music of the universe surrounds humans, so they have gotten used to it. Humans do not realize the existence of the music of the spheres, but they will recognize its absence if it stops. Here, the existence is not what matters or makes humans able to listen to it; it can be compared to the presence of air. We know it is there, but when it vanishes, we realize its absence more than its presence. This is the analogous to the music of the planets. It can be said that music is a part of nature, which is an advantage in the case of the creation of Middle-earth. Music has flickering vibrations that, when they come together, they compose melodies. Fëanor, Noldorin Prince was the strongest Ainu. Even though he was extremely competent, at the same time he was grievously proud, jealous, and angry as to creativity. He was a real master of constructing gems and crystals, notably the Silmarili. The Silmarili are the three gems that shine with the light of the Two Trees. The coating of the gems is made of silima, but the core is the ever-incandescent light of the Two Trees that are illuminating Middle-earth. Tolkien affirms: In order for Fëanor to reach his full potential he might have gotten a new idea or maybe he received a vision about the disaster that was approaching. He started to contemplate possibilities of how the light of the Trees can be preserved. After that he started a long and secret coinage to forge the Silmarils. He used all his knowledge, strength and powers for this invention. Melkor's name changed to Morgoth after his restriction for three ages. He destroyed the Two Trees of Valinor and made Middle-earth sink into darkness. Moreover, Morgoth stole the Silmarills and escaped from Aman using the darkness to his advantage (Tolkien, 1999, p. 108). To get more into the vibration melody, and the connection between human bodies and cosmos, another explanation can be very resourceful.

A Boston University physicist named H. Eugene Stanley and his research group demonstrate that human DNA makes a flickering noise. This analysis may show that even humans are part of the cosmos and the universe's musical creation. This may also mean that the music of the universe is engraved in the human body. It can be said that humans and the cosmos are connected to each other via music. Everything is connected in unity throughout harmonic melodies. The connection between music, the body, and the cosmos can be explained through the flickering

noise's comprehensiveness. It is like a spiral that goes back thousands of light-years and is continuing far into the future, creating musical connections between the universes (Flow Motion, 2006).

The importance of music in philosophy, science, and the universe and their reflection in *The Silmarillion* can be understood by depending on the discussion given above.

As it is stated before music is one of the major elements in Middle-earth, and its role can be linked to modern religions. Although, this thesis' intention isn't about establishing a connection between modern religions and Tolkien's *The Silmarillion*, in the process of sub-creation, as discussed before, there are still traces of the primary world in *The Silmarillion*. For example, the trumpet is mentioned in 64 verses in the Holy Bible. The trumpet is also mentioned in the Quran 13 times (Quran). The trumpet, which is called a "shofar" in Judaism, is also mentioned in the Torah (Torah). An example from the Quran would be Surah Anam, Ayat 73, which states: "And it is He who created the heavens and earth in truth. And the day He says, 'Be,' and it is, His word is the truth. And His is the dominion [on] the Day the Horn is blown. [He is] Knower of the unseen and the witnessed; and He is the Wise, the Acquainted" (Quran [6:73]). This shows that music is also mentioned throughout modern religions.

As previously mentioned, logos and music play a significant role in the birth of Middle-earth. They are the two components that help bring Middle-earth into existence. Logos is a set of organized rules that come together; they are complementary to Pythagoras' music theory, where he argues that all intervals are combined with each other to create absolute agreement. Heraclitus defines harmony (Harmonia) as two contradictions that come together. At the same time, "Harmonia" is a Pythagorean term used by Pythagoras to show the connection of intervals together during musical creation. Logos is also seen as inseparable, and it is involved in every element it describes. In this case, it can be said that logos describes every matter, and it is present in every matter. This means that logos is also present in music, where the elements are gathered together and the outcome is a harmonic melody, just as it is experienced in the creation of Middle-earth, where the Ainur play their harmonic melody in the process of creation.

As described before, nomos is the theory of law. Music has its independent

law, which means that music cannot be created without a set of rules that combines all notes together so as to create a melody. This set of rules can be seen as the recesses and the synchronization that connect everything into a choral melody. In this case, the relationship between logos and nomos can be established. Consequently, to generate a melody, the set of musical rules should be tacit and compiled accordingly. Music can be seen as a universal language; it is something that has an effect on many people and changes their emotions just as in the way how literature serves for people. As Norman and Holland state “Literature is not things, but a way to comprehend things.” J.R.R Tolkien crafts his Middle-earth like a chorus whereby each musical note starts to be shaped in the minds of the readers through some juxtapositions with the primary world. It is because as Lionel Thrilling utters “Literature is the human activity that takes the fullest and most precise account of variousness, possibility, complexity, and difficulty.” Therefore, logos depends on what is universal in the primary world, but at the same time, it is not exact with regard to its laws, which means it is similar to music, whereas the style, tone, beat, and melody of music differs from one country to another, but a set of rules still gathers these elements together. In other words, in Middle-earth we have many different races such as Numenorians, Elves, Orcs, Urukhai, Demons, Giant spiders, Ents, Valars, Dwarves, Balrogs and so on. An example to show the varieties of races in Middle-earth are the Elves, “... in that hour the Children of the Earth awoke, the Firstborn of Illuvatar. By the starlit mere of Cuivienen, Water of Awakening, they rose from the sleep of Illuvatar; and while they dwelt yet silent by Cuivienen their eyes beheld first of all things the stars of heaven” (Tolkien, 1999, p. 45). The awakening of Men is another example for the diversities of the races; “[a]t the first rising of the Sun the Younger Children of Illuvatar awoke in the land of Hildorien in the eastward regions of Middle-earth; but the first Sun arose in the West, and the opening eyes of Men were turned towards it, and their feet as they wandered over the Earth for the most part strayed that way” (Tolkien, 1999, p. 115), Not all creations are good like the Elves and Men, for instance the Balrogs are one of Melkor’s evil and dark creations:

“[a]nd in Utumno he gathered his demons about him, those spirits who first adhered to him in the days of his splendor, and became most like him in his corruption: their hearts were of fire, but they were cloaked in darkness, and terror went before them; they had whips of flame. Balrogs they were named in

Middle-earth in later days” (Tolkien, 1999, p. 43).

Middle-earth is a complicated place where there is an ultimate competition for supremacy. From that perspective, it is very similar to what has been undergoing in the earth politics among different countries, and this shows how Tolkien assembles and utilizes his logos to make readers imagine infinite correlations in their primary worlds.

According to Pythagoras and his philosophy intending to reach ‘Harmonia,’ all of the tones have to be filled in and fitted together, resulting in a completed octave which is considered Harmonia. On the other hand, Harmonia unmistakably means a fitted whole, which can be interpreted as tones connected to each other under a set of rules. It is exactly the world that the Ainur try to create before Melkor tries to interrupt them. As Heraclitus sees, harmony as a whole structure, which transmits an ongoing, visible tension rather than sounding like melted music, Melkor’s very first self-employed mission is to disturb this structure” Melkor was the discord of music, so he was the disharmony of the Eä. Of the children of Ilúvatar, Elves were not to yield to Melkor’s lies very quickly. Elves were “the fairest of all earthly creatures” (Tolkien, 1999, p. 35). Even the single tones that are produced through the lyre’s strings transmit tension. The Pythagorean term ‘Harmonia’ is also used by Heraclitus, where he argues that contradictions enter a state of harmony and, as mentioned earlier, logos can also have the meaning of contradictions, because according to Heraclitus’ view, everything is created out of oppositions. At the same time, Pythagoras argues that “from discordant tones come the fairest tunes.” This can be interpreted to mean that new harmony and new melodies can be created through contradictive tones. Likewise, the more awkward creatures Melkor created, the tougher struggle maintained by the rest of the Ainur. Orome was the first Ainu to discover the awakening of the Elves. Some of the Elves feared him, because of the stories of a mysterious dark rider, who abducts Elves. Those rumors are made by Melkor to scare the Elves. Orome stayed for a while among the Elves and listened to their stories. After that he returned to the Ainur and told them about what he had heard. The Ainur decided to hold a council. Manwe stated that this council is held with Illuvatar being in his heart. He also said that they have to rescue the Elves from Melkor’s shadows, no matter what the cost. The Ainur decided to go to war against Melkor and he never forgot that this war and his destruction was because of the Elves

(Tolkien, 1999, p. 45-48). “Melkor met onset of the Valar in the North-west of Middle-earth, and all that region was much broken. But the first victory of the hosts of the West was swift, and the servants of Melkor fled before them to Utumno” (Tolkien, 1999, p. 48). After the first round, Tulkas, being considered as the champion of the Ainur, wrestled Melkor, and tied him with chains. “Then Tulkas stood forth as champion of the Valar and wrestled with him, and cast him upon his face; and he was bound with the chain Angainor...” (Tolkien, 1999, p. 49). After the war was over, the Ainur took Melkor with them to Valinor, while he was chained up and blind folded. The Ainur took Melkor to the Ring of Doom where he was lying beneath the feet of Manwe asking for forgiveness. His plea was denied and he was sentenced to be prisoned for three ages (Tolkien, 1999, p. 49).

Because of the multiple meanings that logos carries, logos and music go hand in hand together. They complete each other, and in this case, they complete the process of the creation of Middle-earth in *The Silmarillion*. As displayed above, for the whole atrocities that Melkor invented against the Ainur, they always had a new way to rebalance the system. Like in our primary world when there is a demonic power, when there is an un-equalizer there will always be a balancer and an equalizer. As we referred to Ovidius’ words earlier, when there is light there is dark, when there is death, there is life. All these aspects are needed to create a fictional world.

As a result, this chapter not only shows the importance of Pythagoras’ theory of the music of the spheres, but also sheds light on how music is regarded in different aspects, as well as its importance in diverse fields. Music not only plays a significant role in Tolkien’s Middle-earth, but also plays a major role in philosophy, math, science, the cosmos, and modern religions, as they are the parts of the primary world. Consequently, this chapter outlines different debates about music, but the most important one for this research is Pythagoras’ music of the spheres, and that music creates harmony, just like the harmony that the Ainur create while fighting Melkor’s discourse throughout the creation of Middle-earth.

IV. THE MUSICAL CREATION OF MIDDLE-EARTH

This chapter will emphasize the creation of a fictional world called Middle-earth in *The Silmarillion*. The creation of the universe has always been a serious concern for philosophers and scientists from all ages. Middle-earth has been shaped through music, as a fascinating exploration, and this exploration will be the vocal point of this chapter. Whereby, we are going to go through this process which is illustrated by the existence of logos in Middle-earth. Before further examining the construction of Middle-earth, a short explanation of it will help to understand some of the geographical aspects.

Middle-earth lies primarily between two continents which are Aman, in the furthest West. It is separated from the East Sea; the furthest Eastern part by an ocean named Belegaer and the Land of the Sun. Middle-earth is a huge continent, which occupies the centric areas of Arda. Out of the regions that exist, the Westlands are the most prominent lands of the continent.

Eru, who is also known as Ilúvatar, creates the Ainur from his offspring. The Ainur used to sing to Ilúvatar individually or in small groups. Each Ainu has only an inevitable part of understanding, which means that they are qualified to sing or play only a particular melody. The more time they spend understanding each other, the more their powers grow over time. The more they listen to each other, the more their understanding and knowledge increase, and through this, they not only become closer, but are also united and become one. The Ainur reach unity through listening to each other and understanding each other's music, which means that they are harmonic (Tolkien, 1999, p. 3). As mentioned, unity and harmony play a significant role in music, as stated by Pythagoras. Verlyn Flieger, in her book *Splintered Light: Logos and Language in Tolkien's World*, mentions that "The primal Word was the Music, actualized by the first imperative, 'Ea! Let these things Be!' Both the Music and 'Ea!'" (Flieger, 2002, p. 74). In this quote, Flieger is striving to show the importance of music throughout the creation of Middle-earth.

Emphasizing the component that helps the Ainur unite, the central part of Ainur's unity is that they focus on listening to each other. Geoffrey Stephen Kirk, an acknowledged scholar with multiple publications who was fascinated with Heraclitus, states that listening is a form of logos (Lloyd-Jones, 2005). He also states, "[t]hese who speak with sense are made strong by what is common to all in the same way as a city (is made strong by) its law, and with much greater strength for all the laws of men are fortified by one law, the Devine law" (Reames, 2013, p. 338). The Ainur's strength grows and becomes united through the art of listening to each other's music, and as previously mentioned, music is gathered by specific laws. The logos can be considered the Ainur's music, and nomos comes from Greek and means the concept of law. Therefore, if the music of the Ainur is logos and logos has a relationship with the concept of law known as nomos, this means that the laws that are needed to compose music can be regarded as nomos. In Kirk's statement, he explains that, "[t]hose who speak with sense are made strong by what is common to all". It is plausible to presume that each Ainur is familiar with a part of Ilúvatar's mind, which means that to each Ainur, a part of Ilúvatar's mind is common. The reason for this is that each Ainur represents only a fraction of Ilúvatar's thoughts. This idea is can be supported with the following quote from *The Silmarillion*, "... for each comprehended only that part of the mind of Ilúvatar from which he came" (Tolkien, 1999, p. 3). This statement reveals that each Ainur is born from a fraction of his thoughts, and in that case, each Ainur is only familiar with a fraction of Ilúvatar's mind, and that fraction is what they know, and what is familiar to them.

Having clarified the connection between logos, nomos, the Ainur, and their music, the emphases will be shifted to what happens during the forming process of Middle-earth. Before the procedure starts, Ilúvatar calls the Ainur together and tells them, "Of the theme that I have declared to you, I will now that ye make in harmony together a Great Music. And since I have kindled you with the flame imperishable, ye shall show forth your powers in adorning this theme..." (Tolkien, 1999, p. 3). In this statement, the concordance that Ilúvatar mentions refers to the music that the Ainur will play. Moreover, a similar quote exists in *The Book of Lost Tales*, where Ilúvatar states, "It is my desire now that ye make a great and glorious music and a singing of this theme; and seeing that I have taught you much and set brightly the Secret Fire within you..." (Tolkien, 2015, p. 53). It is obvious that Ilúvatar requests

the Ainur to play music and sing in expectation of expressing the theme of the world they are inventing or the reality that is exposed to them by Ilúvatar himself.

Here, we have one part of the creation: the music and the harmony are both considered logos, as explained in this chapter. The imperishable fire or Secret Fire that Ilúvatar mentions is a different form of logos. As explained in the first chapter, fire is seen as the element of elements. In the same statement, Ilúvatar utters a theme that he has revealed to the Ainur. The truth can be interpreted as the theme that Ilúvatar reveals to the Ainur. The logos is the music that is created by the Ainur, and, as discussed earlier, the Ainur have to understand each other's music and melodies. They understand each other's logos and act upon it while combining it with the theme, which is the truth that Ilúvatar exposes to them.

The harmony that is achieved by the Ainur not only refers to Pythagoras' Harmonia, but also complements logos. A harmonic interval is achieved through a set of rules implied by a numeral, also known as a 'figure'." For example, a "6" refers to a musical note six degrees of the scale above a given bass note (Bent, 2021). This example shows that numbers play a major role in music and the division of the musical notes to reach harmony. To reach harmony, individual musical voices, in this case, the Ainur, create music to gather and form a united piece (masterclass.com staff, 2021). If we take a band as an example, each member of the band will play a sure note or melody with their instrument, but at the end, when listening to all of the notes and melodies combined, a united piece of music which is harmonic is revealed. The main reason for Sauron's desire was "[f]or those who had them in their keeping could ward off the decays of time and postpone the weariness of the world." The inexorable war between the Elves and Sauron started when Sauron realized that it was not conceivable to control the Elves. Hence, Sauron led his attention towards the Men and the Dwarves. To get them under control, Sauron gave seven rings to Dwarves and nine rings to Men "for Men proved in this matter as in others the readiest to his will. Those who used the nine rings used to be the kings, sorcerers and the warriors once upon a time in the past (Tolkien, 1979, p. 450-451). The link to logos in this part is as follows: Heraclitus states that logos belongs to all numbers toward each other. As previously explained, the music is the logos in this case. In the music of the Ainur lies more depth than only the creation of Middle-earth. The music itself is created through the rules by which it is gathered and the harmony achieved

by each Ainur. Understanding each other and playing together as a whole represents a form of logos. As the Ainur start playing their music, it expresses the theme of truth that Ilúvatar has immersed them in from interchanging melodies woven in harmony...” (Tolkien, 1999, p. 3). This quote clarifies how each single Ainur starts with his/her independent music. As a result, the music is combined together and creates harmony/one piece of music. As Heraclitus states, “Logos is not only a speech but also a speaker, for he is audible to us.” This is more proof of why the music of the Ainur should be regarded as a form of logos. In this exact part, it becomes clearer how logos is mixed with music and musical harmony. Logos here is the speaker, which in this case is the music of the Ainur. Unlike the previous part of this chapter where logos is the listener, they are related to the Ainur listening and understanding each other’s music/logos. The music of the Ainur reached everywhere, even into the nothingness, which is described as “the void” in *The Silmarillion*. With the music that the Ainur create, the nothingness starts to disappear.

Among the Ainur, Melkor is given the most power and knowledge. He visits the deserted places in Middle-earth many times in order to find the imperishable flame. The reason why Melkor searches for the imperishable flame is that he wants to be a creator like Eru and make things on his own, and this can be highlighted with the following quote, “...the secret flame giveth life Reality (for he had a very hot desire to bring things into being of his own)...” (Tolkien, 2015, p. 53). Melkor wants to take Ilúvatar’s place and start creating things on his own, but unlike Ilúvatar, Melkor’s intentions are not innocent or for the sake of unity. Rather, he has an anarchic soul through which he wants to create disorder and anarchy. For example, whatever the Ainur create on Middle-earth, he interferes with the perfection of their creation and causes distortion, just as he caused in the musical formation in the beginning. Melkor never finds the imperishable flame because it is with Ilúvatar, and Ilúvatar is sure that the Ainur will get hold of it during the creation process. Melkor has a mixture of the strength that the other Ainur possess. He looks for the imperishable flame because he wants to create something on his own. A reason why Melkor doesn’t find the flame could be because the flame is within Fëanor, who is one of the strongest of the Ainur. “For Fëanor was made the mightiest in all parts of body and mind, in valour, in endurance, in beauty, in understanding, in skill, in strength and in subtlety alike, of all the Children of Ilúvatar, and a bright flame was

in him” (Tolkien, 1999, p.108). This quote shows that there is a possibility of the flame not even being in the void, but being within Fëanor. Ilúvatar does not consider the void, which makes Melkor impatient.

Melkor interprets his thoughts through his music. As he hears the music of the Ainur, he starts playing his discord with the goal of interrupting the Ainur and taking over their music to create what he wants instead of what the Ainur imagine. Ilúvatar listens to everything that happens around him, while at the same time, some of the Ainur try harder not to join Melkor’s discord. “...[M]any of those that played nigh him grew despondent and their music feeble, and their thoughts unfinished and unclear, while many others fell to attuning their music to his rather than to the great theme when they began” (Tolkien, 2015, p. 54).

This quote implements the suffering of the Ainur, trying to concentrate on the main theme while playing their music and it becomes very difficult for them to remain in harmony. It also shows how some of the Ainur begin to adjust to Melkor’s theme. In this case, Melkor succeeds with his plan to interrupt the Ainur and cause them to lose concentration as well as unity. Ilúvatar keeps observing them until Melkor’s discord grows darker and more violent, as if there was a war and thunder in the air. The equivalent of the above-mentioned quote and explanation from *The Silmarillion* is the following one: “...and many that sang nigh him grew despondent, and their thought was disturbed and their music faltered; but some began to attune their music to his rather than to the thought which they had at first. The discord of Melkor spread ever wider, and the melodies which had been heard before foundered in a sea of turbulent sound” (Tolkien, 1999, p. 4). Only then does Ilúvatar direct the Ainur to a different theme, “...a new theme began among the clash, like and yet unlike the first, and it gathered the power of sweetness.” This likeness and unlikeness here is a direct connotation for the primary and the sub creation of Tolkien’s Middle-earth, where even the things change, still likeness and unlikeness co-exist. “But the discord and noise that Melkor had aroused started into uproar against it, and there was a war of sounds, and a clangor arose in which little could be distinguished” (Tolkien, 2015, p. 54). This statement paints a clear picture of the scene that unfolds; it demonstrates a war, not with weapons, but through music. The same quote is also found in *The Silmarillion*:

“...and a new theme began amid the storm, like and yet unlike the former theme, and it gathered power and had new beauty. But the discord of Melkor rose in uproar and contended with it, and again there was a war of sound more violent than before, until many of the Ainur were dismayed and sang no longer, and Melkor had the mastery” (Tolkien, 1999, p. 5).

Not every action is fought by weapons, as in this case, where Melkor fights against the Ainur to stop the forming process, and their weapon is music. The Ainur start playing their melody and music as loudly and strongly as possible until they are drained.

Ilúvatar then arouses the Ainur and commands them to halt. As he requests them to stop, a third theme comes to life. Two different kinds of music are played at once. One is calm, harmonic, sad, wide, and beautiful. The other is loud and has little harmony, and it is rather harsh. The second form of music, which is Melkor's, includes a lot of trumpets. (Tolkien, 1999, P5). The two different types of music are clearly contradicting each other. The Ainur's music is filled with harmony, emotions, and softness; on the other hand, Melkor's is harsh, wild, and loud. “... as it essayed to clash most fearsomely, finding itself but some manner supplementing or harmonizing with its rival” (Tolkien, 2015, p. 54). These lines can be associated with one of Heraclitus' paradoxes, where he states that all things are created in strife (Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy, 2018). Empedocles, by advancing Heraclitus' paradoxes, talks about the concept of power that works in the cosmos, conflict, or animus, amity, or affection under Heraclitus' impact and his logical variances working together beneath the cosmos' law. Empedocles, like Heraclitus, believes love and strife attract and repel four substances. Like magnetic polarity, strife causes the elements to be repelled from each other, while love causes a positive charge of attracting and pulling them together in a cosmic dance (The Editors of Encyclopedia Britannica, c2021). It is logos that infiltrates nature completely. In a sense, that the contradictions that are present in nature make a whole and are the reason for the existence of the world.

Nevertheless, it is a global law: every individual has own thoughts. The power is not based on an individual motive toward the world, although it could depend on the law of the global course (Hillar, 2012, p. 15). Even though Melkor aims to disrupt the Ainur and the creation process, he does not succeed in the end,

because in one way or another, his discord is harmonizing and uniting the Ainur's music. His Dis cacophony makes them stronger and more united. They work together and do their best in order to overcome Melkor's discord. Ilúvatar arouses for the third time during the middle of the contradiction, and he lifts both of his hands and stops the music at once. He praises the Ainur, including Melkor. He also tells Melkor that no theme can destroy his creation, because he is the almighty. Melkor intends to ruin the creation process and to stop it, but Ilúvatar makes it clear that his intentions play in his favor to create a more complex and more beautiful world. Even though Melkor brings all of the negative elements, such as sorrow, darkness, and evil, into being through his discordance, they now coexist within the world and the theme that Ilúvatar has laid before the Ainur. According to Ilúvatar, what makes life worth living in this new world is the existence of Melkor's pain, misery, and darkness, which are a part of this new world (Tolkien, 1999, p. 5-6). This symbiotic form of coexistence of the opposite elements and powers bring us back to the very beginning where the thesis claims that every single material's existence depends on a juxtaposition as Ovidius explains in his *Metamorphoses*. Thus, the symbols that stand for logos can vary but eventually these logos create a bizarre harmony through cacophony. This explains why Middle-earth is still in balance, although nearly all the races vie for supremacy. This is because the inhabitants of this world will be able to experience or feel not only joy and comfort, but also sadness and hopelessness, and the ability to overcome them (Tolkien, 2015, p. 55). This condition expresses how a world is supposed to be, and that both sides, dark and light, are a part of the world and life. It shows how those contradictions, sadness and joy, evil and good, discomfort and comfort, coexist in the world and make life more interesting and challenging. The Ainur do not comprehend everything that Ilúvatar says, so Ilúvatar shows the Ainur the results of their music. He shows them what they create with their music. He also asks them to follow him into the void. They follow him into the middle of the void, and where it once was empty and dark it is now an extremely beautiful place, and the Ainur are amazed.

Ilúvatar tells them that even though they play their music under his command, this is what their music creates and what it shapes. What the Ainur see and what has been brought to life will be the beginning of the history of Middle-earth. Every Ainur will find and discover the things that they have put into their music, which are shown

to them by Ilúvatar. Even Melkor will discover the dark thoughts that he has added to this world, not as a separate component, but as a part of the created world. The only thing that Ilúvatar has added is the Secret Fire, which will bring life and reality. This secret fire burns at the heart of the world (Tolkien, 2015, p. 55). This mentioned process of the forming of Middle-earth displays how everything starts to coexist in the world, such as Melkor's negative thoughts and the Ainur's beautiful ideas. Both sides exist together in one world, completing each other. This is logos as previously stated where opposites complete each other. Furthermore, the secret fire that burned in the heart of the world can be seen as the world's core. Just like the Earth has a core where the outer core is made out of magma, which is very hot and can reach between 7000 – 9000°F (nationalgeographic.com). Whereas the inner core is solid and made out of iron, it is the hottest point of the earth, and it can reach 10.000 °F or even more, which is as hot as the Sun's surface. Just as the core is the hottest part and the center of the earth, the secret fire or the imperishable flame that has been inserted by Ilúvatar into the heart of the world can be regarded as the core of the newly created world, Middle-earth. The secret fire in Tolkien's Middle-earth represents an element of the primary world which is the world's core. As previously explained in the first chapter, one of the many meanings that logos has is that it is a paradox, something with multiple meanings.

History may or may not make people witness that new thing come after destruction; after every war, there has been an improved version of countries/cities. People progress after wars and work toward modernity. Following the destruction that comes with war is the birth of new conditions. Out of this destruction, a new life and greater stability are created. Even when one looks at Hiroshima Nagasaki, and Chernobyl, he/she can see that life always finds a way to emerge. All in all, this part may explain how, after the musical war that the Ainur fought against Melkor, a new world is born. This is significantly valid during the time when the Ainur suffer to overcome Melkor's discord. It can serve as a testament to their hard work, the fight they undertook through their melodies, and their harmony, which serve as reasons to make something new. All of these contradictions represent more reasons to confirm that logos exists throughout the forming of Middle-earth, because Middle-earth is created in strife and through contradictions.

V. COMPARISON AND CONTRAST OF THE AINUR WITH THE GREEK GODS

Music was an indispensable part of life in ancient Greek history. It covered not only music, but also dance, lyrics, and poetry. A vast spectrum of instruments was used to play music. Music was played on various occasions such as religious ceremonies, festivals, weddings, funerals, and so on. Music was also an essential aspect in education and Greek drama. The ancient Greek believed that music was a gift from the gods. The contraption of specific musical tools is associated with peculiar gods: Hermes the lyre, Pan the panpipes, and Athena the flute. In Greek mythology the Muses embodied the different elements of music, and they were entertaining the gods on Mount Olympus with their celestial music, dancing, and singing. (Cartwright, 2013) The Greek god Apollo was recognized as the god of music after winning two contests, playing on his seven-stringed lyre. The first contest was against Marsyas. During that contest the Muses were the judges. Whereas, the second contest was against Pan, where King Midas was the judge (Graves, 2011, p. 77). In Grecian times music, poetry, philosophy, astronomy, mathematics, medicine, and science were controlled by Apollo. He was the foe of atrocity; he was supporting fairness in all aspects. The seven strings of his lyre were linked with the seven vowels of the later Greek alphabet, inured esoteric connotation, and used for remedial music (Graves, 2011, p. 82). Ancient Greek history and Greek mythology in this case is the primary world whereas Middle-earth is the secondary world. Aspects of the primary world are seen within Tolkien's Middle-earth. For this reason, this chapter plays an important role to show the connection and the influence of the Greek deities who are the primary world elements with the Ainur who are the secondary world gods. This chapter will compare the Ainur with their equivalent Greek gods or goddesses. Each Ainu and Greek god/goddess will be analyzed individually to clarify and show the link between them, as well as their differences. The character analysis of the Ainur is taken from *The Silmarillion* as a conclusion of each Ainu's attributes. Tolkien was influenced by Greek mythology during the time

he was working on *The Silmarillion*. This is the reason why the Ainur have similar attributes to those of the Greek gods, and even muses and spirits. The Ainur and Melkor created Middle-earth. Each Ainu shares similarities with Greek gods. Some of the Ainur are even a combination of more than one Greek god. Of the 14 Ainur, eight are the high ones. Melkor used to be one of the mightiest Ainur, but he fell from grace because of his wrath. Therefore, the first character to be analyzed is Melkor, who is also known as Margoth, and he is the brother of Manwe. Melkor was one of the strongest of the Ainur until he was disregarded by them because he interrupted the music of the Ainur during the creation of Middle-earth as mentioned previously. Melkor manipulated some of the Ainur and Ilúvatar's children to his benefit. The Ainur started losing trust in him, and he was bound by the chains that were created by Aulë and sent into the void. Melkor was the one who started wars against the children of Ilúvatar, who were the elves and the men. He also stole the silmarills and destroyed the lamps. The omen is that he would rise again with even more wrath than he had after escaping the void. Even though he was banished into the void, he had his little minions and his lieutenant Sauron to bring evil into the world. After the Ainur defeated Melkor, Sauron betrayed his master and became the second Dark Lord. He wanted to take over Middle-earth and destroy it. "...Sauron's growth to a new Dark Lord, master and god of Men; and Numenor-Atlantis" (Tolkien, 1999, p. xxi).

Melkor's character is a combination of Hades and the Greek spirit Lyssa. He is compared to those two because his hate and wrath against Ilúvatar can be seen as the same as Hades' hatred toward Zeus. Additionally, because Melkor is filled with wrath, he has attributes of the Greek spirit of wrath and anger, Lyssa. Hades is the god of the underworld and the death in Greek mythology, and he is one of Zeus' brothers. Hades lived in the underworld, even though he was one of the Olympian gods. This explains why he disliked Zeus, because he was not able to have the same upper status as the other Olympians. He did not know about the world's fate, nor did he punish the dead souls; he was merely their keeper. Hades was one of the least liked and most feared Gods because he was vicious (Hamilton, 1998, p.). Moreover, Hades' world was a mere world of shadows when Achillis died, he was sent to the underworld and in Homer's the *Odyssey*, Odysseus meets Achillis and Achillis confesses the fact that he would rather be a slave or a peasant in the world than being

the king of the dead (Knox, 1999, p. 265). On the other hand, Lyssa is the Greek spirit of wrath. She isn't one of the Olympians but, rather, existed before the time when Olympians took over and ruled over the world. She is known for planting rage and wrath into humans as well as spirits. Her ability is to blind them with it, where they lose control and fight each other. Lyssa even planted rage and madness into Hercules because of Hera's orders. As an outcome, Hercules was blinded with anger and killed his wife and children. Lyssa has major control over her powers and does not abuse them. She uses them only when she thinks it is the last choice available to her (Graves, 2011, p. 189). Melkor is a combination of Hades and Lyssa. Even though Melkor didn't rule the underworld, he was sent to the void, which is as dark as the underworld. His similarity with Hades is his hate toward Ilúvatar and the darkness to which he was banished. He has the characteristic of wrath and anger, just as Lyssa has. Like her, he was manipulating people and causing them to fight, even starting wars. The difference between Melkor and Lyssa, though, is that he plants hatred and wrath between others on purpose in order to benefit from it, while Lyssa had full control over her ability and used it only when necessary.

The second character analysis will be Manwe. Manwe, like Melkor, is one of the eldest Ainur. He has the best understanding of what Ilúvatar wants. After Melkor's discord started during the creation of Middle-earth, Manwe took over the second theme in order to fight the discord. After the creation of Arda, Manwe became the ruler of Arda. Manwe is a very simple and passionate ruler filled with care. He imprisoned Melkor in the halls of Mandos. Because he had a good heart, after a while, Melkor had the chance to plead for mercy and forgiveness in front of Manwe. Manwe is the lord of air and winds (Tolkien, 1999, p.) He has attributes of the Greek god Zeus and Aeolus from Homer's *The Odyssey*. Zeus is the god of the sky and the lord of the gods. Zeus is one of the first Olympian gods, and he rules from Mount Olympus. All the high ranked gods and goddesses except Hades reside on Mount Olympus. Zeus' power is lightning and thunder, and he uses them as weapons. The other gods, who were his siblings, respected Zeus a lot and joined him in the battle against the Titans (Bulfinch, 1947, p. 4).

Aeolus is a character who mostly appeared Homer's *The Odyssey* and is a minor god. He is the god of the winds. Aeolus gifted Odysseus two kinds of wind. One of them was helpful, which would help Odysseus, and the other was caught in a

bag and was the bad wind. As the crew of Odysseus released the wind that was captured in the bag, it sent their ship back to the island (Bulfinch, 1947, p. 69). Even though Manwe does not have similar powers like Zeus, he still carries some of his characteristics, like being the lord of the Ainur and living on a mountain. Manwe's siblings had an immense amount of respect toward him and joined him in the battle against Melkor. The same thing is valid for Zeus' siblings, who joined Zeus' battle against Cronus. Both of them were merciful rulers. Aeolus is a minor god in Homer's *Odyssey* who has the same powers as Manwe, wind, and air. This is why Manwe is a combination of these two gods.

The subsequent analysis is of Manwe's wife, Varda. She helps Manwe to rule Arda. She is one of the most gorgeous Ainur; her face reflects Ilúvatar's light. She is the first Ainu to distrust Melkor, and he feared her the most because he had no control over the light, unlike her. She is the lady of the stars and created the stars. The first lights the elves see after their awakening are Varda's stars. She also filled the lamps with her light. Varda is the lady who brought brightness into the world. Even after the death of the two trees, she brought back the light and created the Sun and the Moon in order to brighten up Middle-earth. The elves love her the most and pray to her (Tolkien, 1999, p. 428). Varda's characteristics are a mixture of Hera and Asteria, the latter of which is a titan. Hera is Zeus' wife and the queen of the deities. She resides with him on Mount Olympus and rules by his side. Hera is one of the most beautiful goddesses. She is the goddess of marriage and birth and is worshipped all over Greece. Hera is very jealous because of her husband's unfaithfulness. On the other hand, Asteria is the titan of the stars and night. She was a goddess during the golden age when the titans ruled over the cosmos. She is also the goddess of dreams and nightly oracles. As the titans fell, she escaped Zeus and fell into the ocean, transforming herself into an island (Bulfinch, 1947, p. 6). Varda is a combination of Hera and Asteria. Varda, who is very similar to Hera, rules beside her husband on a mountain and is the queen of the Ainur. Unlike Hera, she is not jealous, and her husband is faithful to her. The similarities between Hera and Varda are that they both rule over the other gods and they are both beautiful. Varda and Asteria share the same powers; they are the ladies of the stars. Even though Asteria has other powers, the stars are her primary power. This is how Varda is similar to these two Greek goddesses and is a mixture of both of them.

Ulmo is the god of waters and is a close friend to Manwe. After Manwe and Varda, he is one of the strongest of the Ainur. Melkor fears him as much as he fears Varda because the sea cannot be controlled. He lives in Arda but not on the ground; he lives in the waters of Arda. Ulmo controls all the waters, the seas, rivers, and bays. He keeps an eye on Arda through the rivers, and this is the reason why he knew what was happening to the children of Ilúvatar, even before Manwe. Ulmo is one of the biggest reasons for the fall of Melkor. Ulmo has a good heart and loved the elves and men, and he always helped them. The way Ulmo communicates to the elves and men is through music, which is also called the music of the waters. He is the Ainu who has the most significant command over music, and it is believed that the echo of the music of the Ainur is still heard in the deep waters that Ulmo controls. Ulmo is also the friendliest Ainur toward the children of Ilúvatar. Poseidon is the Greek god of the sea and all waters; he also rules over the earthquakes. He is the brother of Zeus and Hades. He is bad-tempered and greedy. Poseidon loves to take revenge when annoyed. Poseidon's actions depend on his mood. If he is in a good mood, he is kind and lovable. He even forms new lands and new bodies of water. Nevertheless, if he is in a bad mood, he causes floods and earthquakes, and through these, many people die. He would even misuse his powers to extract revenge on the gods and demigods that annoyed him. Because Poseidon is the god of the sea, sailors pray to him for safe voyage and worship him (Hamilton, 1998, p. 27-28). Here, some similarities and differences between the attributes of Ulmo and Poseidon can be observed. It is relatively easy to compare Ulmo to Poseidon because of what they rule over. Both are gods of water. However, unlike Poseidon, Ulmo has a good heart and is friendly and helpful. In that regard, Poseidon is a little different and moody. Poseidon can be analyzed as an arrogant character, and his greed is somehow similar to the greed of Aulë. Ulmo and Poseidon both have full control over any form of water. This control is the main attribute that connects them.

Aulë is the lord of the earth and natural substances. He is also the smith of the Ainur, and one of the high ones. During the creation of Middle-earth, Aulë was more focused on the structure of the land. He created the natural substances, mountains, and rocks. He is similar to Melkor, but he does not envy any other creation but rather enjoys the things he makes. He is very skilled and forges everything from gems, weapons, and body armor. Aulë never wants to betray Ilúvatar. Because he is similar

to Melkor, he tried to fight his discord and treachery with strength. He is similar to Melkor in his love for creating new things and being praised for it. Melkor always destroys Aulë's creations, but Aulë always repairs them. Eventually, he became tired of Melkor's ceaseless destruction. He also forged the chains that were used to chain Melkor. He is the creator of the lamps and the holder of the sun and the moon. Aulë lost patience waiting for Ilúvatar's children to awaken, so he created the dwarves. Ilúvatar knew about his creation, as he confronted Aulë. Aulë asked for forgiveness and offered the dwarves to Ilúvatar. Ilúvatar adopted the dwarves but put them into a deep sleep until the elves awoke. After the elves awakened, the dwarves woke up and became Aulë's helpers (Tolkien, 1999, p. 37-39). Hephaestus is the Greek god of fire and metalworking. He is the smith of the gods. Hephaestus is good-hearted and controls his temper. He can be jealous because he is not as beautiful as the other gods. He lives with his wife, away from the others, and enjoys working in his workshop and creating new things. He works with Cyclops and creates Zeus' thunderbolts. He is also the creator of Pandora (Hamilton, 1998, p. 36-37). Aulë and Hephaestus are very similar in their lifestyle. They both live away from the gods with their wives and enjoy working in their workshops and creating new things. Both work with creatures and live in or under the mountains. Hephaestus works with Cyclops and lives under a volcano. Aulë works with the dwarves and lives in the mountains. Both create things for their higher god. Hephaestus creates things for Zeus, and Aulë creates things for Ilúvatar. Hephaestus formed a living being, Pandora, and Aulë created living beings, the dwarves. Both are very similar; the only difference between them is that Aulë is not jealous, while Hephaestus is. Hephaestus and Aule both brought things to life that share the characteristic of curiosity and greed. Aule's dwarves are very curious and always wanted more gems. On the other hand, Pandora's curiosity and greed made her open the box and kept it open until the very end after all evil things had escaped the box. Pandora and the Dwarves changed the world through their nosiness and gluttony.

When it comes to Aulë's wife, Yavanna. She, like her husband, is one of the high ones. She is the goddess of all living things, especially trees and plants, and planted the first seeds in Middle-earth. During the creation of Middle-earth, her main focus, and what she imagined while playing the music of the Ainur, was tree branches. Melkor was poisoning and killing her creations, so she was supportive of

the plans against him in order to protect her creations. She is responsible for life in Middle-earth. After the destruction of the two lamps, she put all life to sleep, so it would not die. Life here means all plants, trees, and even moss. After the destruction of the lamps as the Ainur left for Aman, Yavanna sang while all of the Ainur were listening to her song. With the help of Nienna's tears, her most precious creation came to life: the two trees. Those two trees were the only sources of light until the creation of the sun and the moon (Tolkien, 1999). Demeter is Yavanna's equivalent of the Greek gods. She is the goddess of agriculture and seasons. She is worshiped all over Greece. Demeter is not considered one of the Olympian gods. She even caused famine for a while. As her daughter Persephone was abducted by Hades, she went to search for her and left her duties as a goddess of the harvest. Demeter and Yavanna are similar to the powers they own, which are growing nature, including trees and fruit. The only small difference is that Yavanna is responsible for growing all sorts of plants, trees, fruit, and more. In comparison, Demeter was primarily responsible for the harvest and the change of the seasons (Bulfinch, 1947, p. 8).

Orome is the god of the hunt and is one of the higher ones. He was present at the awakening of the Elves and became a close friend to them. Even when the Ainur left Middle-earth, he was still hunting there, and this is how he was present at the awakening of the Elves. Orome fought in the battles against Melkor. He also hunted evil creatures and monsters. He hunted all of Melkor's evil creations. Orome is angry and is known for his fury. When he becomes angry, he fights vigorously and seeks revenge against his wrongdoers (Tolkien, 1999). The Greek goddess of the hunt, Artemis is Orome's equivalent. As the goddess of the hunt, Artemis is very strong and is the most popular in the rural areas. She is the virgin goddess and has no interest in men or mating. Artemis spent most of her time in the woods and preferred them over life in the city, so people primarily see Artemis with her maidens, running and dancing in the woods (Graves, 2011, p. 83-86. Hamilton, 1998, p. 364). Even though Orome and Artemis have two different genders, in the end, both are gods of the hunt and are strong. Both spend most of their time in the woods and enjoy hunting.

Vana is Orome's wife and the younger sister of Yavanna. Like her sister, she has powers relating to nature, and she is one of the high ones. Wherever she walks, flowers start to bloom; with one look at her, they start to open. Even birds sing to

Vana when she passes by. Her beauty is godly and earthly at the same time. Vana has her own garden, which is filled with golden flowers (Tolkien, 1999). Her equivalent in Greek mythology is Antheia. She is the goddess of flowers and is recognized through golden-colored items. She is also considered to be the goddess of vegetation and self-love. Antheia is a weak goddess and cannot defend herself; thus, she has a hard time with the other gods (greekgodsandgoddesses.net, 2019). Vana and Antheia are both goddesses of flowers, and both are recognized or linked to golden color. Vana lives in a garden with golden flowers, while Antheia is linked to golden-colored items such as honey. Both of the goddesses are beautiful and peaceful. The only difference is that Antheia is one of the weak goddesses, while Vana is the sixth in strength and is one of the high ones.

Mandos is the god of the deceased, and he lives in the halls of Mandos, where the dead spirits reside. He is one of the high ones, and he remembers everything from the past and knows what will happen in future. He takes his judgments after negotiating with Manwe. Even though he knows the future of Arda, only Ilúvatar thoroughly knows how the end of Arda will be, and he does not share this information with Mandos. Mandos and Manwe have been partners at all times, and they best understand Ilúvatar's visions. He is the most rigorous amongst the Ainur, but at the same time, he is not evil or dark. His rigorousness is because of the part of Ilúvatar's thoughts from which he was born. He refuses to expose the fate of Middle-earth and Arda to the other Ainur. It was in his halls where Melkor was put to be punished (Tolkien, 1999). Mandos has attributes of Hades and the three sisters of fate from Greek mythology. Hades' character is explained at the beginning of this chapter. The three sisters of fate in Greek mythology, also called the Moirai, control the fate of humanity and the gods; they can even change someone's fate. They are the goddesses of fate. Each sister has her own task to fulfill. Clotho is the manufacturer of the thread of life. Lachesis measures the length of the thread of life, and the last sister, Aisa, is the cutter of the thread. In this way, the three goddesses are able to take away the life of humans and gods. They decide the fate of living beings from the moment they are born. Even the gods had to accept the fate that was conveyed by them by the three sisters. The three sisters know everything about humans and gods from the moment they are born. They work individually and not with the other gods. As a team, they revealed all the fates (Hamilton, 1998, p. 49).

Mandos is a combination of Hades, the ruler of the underworld, and the Moirai, the three sisters of fate. On the one hand, he has attributes of Hades because he is the keeper of the souls and rules over them, just like Hades. He and Hades are also similar in terms of their anger. On the other hand, he has characteristics of the three sisters, because just like them, he knows the fate of the world and the fate of other living beings. This combination of attributes is what makes Mandos who he is and gives him his strength. Hades and Mandos are feared because they rule over the dead and are the gatekeepers of the spirit world. At the same time, the three sisters are dreaded because they have everyone's fate in their hands.

Vaire is Mandos' wife and resides with him in the halls of Mandos. She has no significant power like the other Ainur who are goddesses, but she makes tapestries of the history of the world. Over time, the halls of Mandos were filled with her wall hangings showing the history of the world. The history of the world is recorded through her artistic tapestries (Tolkien, 1999). Vaire is a combination of the attributes of the Greek goddess Athena and the Greek muse Clio. Athena is primarily known as the Greek goddess of war, but she is also the goddess of wisdom, courage, inspiration, civilization, law, justice, mathematics, strength, strategy, the arts, crafts, skill, and chastity. Athena's birth is similar to the birth of the Ainur. She was born from Zeus' forehead, just like the Ainur, who were born from the offspring of Ilúvatar's thoughts. Athena is one of the Olympians and mostly accompanies heroes on their quests, such as Odysseus because of her strategic skills (Graves, 2011, p. 96-100). Clio is the Greek muse of history and is one of the nine muses. She records history over time (Hamilton, 1998, p.40). Vaire is a mixture of Athena and Clio. Even though she shares only one of Athena's attributes, which is art, Vaire is still different from Athena; she is not as strong as her. Mixing the aspect of art with Clio's history recordings, Vaire's attributes are clarified. As previously mentioned, Vaire records the history of time, but she does it in an artistic way through weaving tapestries of history. That explains why Vaire is a combination of Athena and Clio.

Nienna is Mando's sister and the goddess of grief and sadness. She is also considered one of the high ones and supposed to be the strongest. She does not travel much out of her halls and mostly goes to her brother's galleries to aid the souls that are praying to her. She is empathetic and grieves for the world and her destruction. During the creation of Middle-earth in the music of the Ainur, she adds her sad

feelings and grief. Her tears aided Varda in the creation of the two trees; even after their destruction, she spilled her tear drops on them to purify them. So, the last fruit and flower come out of the trees, which are the sun and the moon. The ones that hear her grieving and crying learn a lot and receive much wisdom. Nienna carries a lot of pity and has a good heart, even though she weeps a lot because of the destruction that Melkor brings to the world. At the same time, when he was pleading for mercy, she was the one aiding and supporting him, and this confirms how good her heart is (Tolkien, 1999). Her attributes are a combination of Achlys, Penthos, the Algea, Oizys, and Eleos from Greek mythology. Achlys is the goddess of misery and sadness. Some also believe that she is the goddess of poison. She enjoys bringing sadness and grief into the world, and also loves to be pitied by others. In order to have mercy, she uses her claws and scratches her cheeks until they bleed. She is rather scary and does not look peaceful. Penthos is the spirit of grief, sadness, and lamentation in Greek mythology and is included in the Algea. The Algea are three sisters/goddesses of grief. They are goddesses of mental and physical pain and suffering. They are the carriers of tears; wherever they go, they make people weep (theoi.com, c2017a). Oizys is the Greek goddess of sadness, anxiety, and depression. She is the personification of human misery and depression. She is always ready to harm people and enjoys seeing their suffering. Even though she sometimes feels regret for the things that she had committed, but never tends to fix them (greekgodsandgoddesses.net, 2019). Eleos is the Greek goddess of pity, mercy, and compassion. She feels sorrow and pity for those who are being harmed. She protects and aids those who are suffering. Eleos is very compassionate and dislikes seeing others suffer (theoi.com, c2017b). Nienna is a mixture of many characters. Unlike Achlys, Penthos, the Algea, and Oizys, she does not bring sadness to the world, nor does she harm people or make them weep and cry. The only characteristic she shares with them is that she is the goddess of sadness and sorrow. Nienna uses her attribute in a very different way; thus, she also has attributes of Eleos, who pities people and helps them. Even though Nienna is the goddess of sorrow, she uses her grief to spread wisdom and help the world. She suffers and cries for the world, which is destructive, and she has a gentle heart, unlike Achlys, Penthos, the Algea, and Oizys, who are evil and spreading sadness.

Irmo is Mandos' and Nienna's brother. He is the god of dreams and visions. He lives with his wife Este in the gardens of Lorien, which are the most beautiful and peaceful gardens in Middle-earth. Because of his dwelling place, he is also known as Lorien, just like his brother Mandos, who lives in the halls of Mandos. Most of the Ainur went to his gardens to relax and cure themselves from their worries and drink from his fountains. Irmo sends dreams and visions to the Elves to help and guide them. He stayed away from fights and wars, and he did not work in public. His powers are unseen to everyone and are relatively hidden. As Varda created the sun and the moon, she wanted them both to be in the sky, just as the two trees shone their light together, but Irmo and his wife suggested to her that she should reconsider and let them shine during two different times. This is how day and night were born. During the day, the sun would shine, and during the night, the moon would provide the light, and it would be time to rest and sleep (Tolkien, 1999). The Greek god of dreams, Morpheus, shares similar attributes to Irmo. Morpheus is the Greek god of dreams. He creates dreams and visions for humans and appears in their dreams as any shape he wants, he also is the messenger and sends messages between the world of the dead and the world of living. He lives in a cave filled with poppy seeds, and only the Olympian gods who live in Olympus can visit him (Bulfinch, 1947, p. 72-73). Irmo and Morpheus are both masters of dreams and send dreams and visions. The only difference here is that Irmo sends dreams and visions to the Elves, while Morpheus sends them to humankind. Even though Morpheus does not live in a big garden, he resides in nature and is surrounded by seeds like Irmo, who lives in the garden of Lorien.

Este is Irmo's wife and resides with him in the garden of Lorien. She is the healer and cures the hurt and tired. Este sleeps during the day and is awake during the night. She sleeps under the shadows of the trees in the garden of Lorien (Tolkien, 1999, p.19). Her characteristics are close to the characteristics of Akeso and Asclepius from Greek mythology. Akeso is the Greek goddess of healing. She does not represent the cure but is, rather, the process of healing. She heals the wounded and the injured (Dimitrios Papagiannis, 2011). Asclepius is the Greek god of healing and medicine. He has the ability to heal humans and even bring them back to life. Hades, the God of the underworld, was getting angry at him because fewer and fewer souls were entering his kingdom. Zeus also feared that his power might be

dangerous, so he struck him with a thunderbolt, and this was the tragic ending of Asclepius (Graves, 2011, p. 79). Este's healing powers are different from Akeso and Asclepius, but all three heal others. Their way of healing is merely in different ways. Este heals the soul and the psyche, while Akeso and Asclepius heal the body. The only thing all three have in common is that they have healing powers.

Tulkas is the lord of war and speed. He is the last to set foot in Arda, and as he heard how the Ainur suffer against Melkor, he joined them in battle and fought in the war against Melkor. He is hasty in his decisions, and after Melkor's release, he urged the Ainur to start a war against him, but Ilúvatar's children awoke. He is the Ainu who chained Melkor with the chains that Aulë created. He was against Melkor's release and was always observing him. It takes time to make Tulkas angry, but at the same time, it also takes a while for him to forgive. Tulkas is a good friend and is not interested in the past or the future. He is a mighty wrestler and does not use any weapons, but, rather, uses the strength of his hands. He is also speedy, so he does not need a stallion or anything to aid him to transport from one place to another. He is the Ainu who has the most physical strength (Tolkien, 1999). His creation might have been influenced by the Greek god of war, Ares, and the Greek god of speed, Hermes. Ares is one of the Olympians and the Greek god of war. He is powerful and is not very popular amongst humans or gods. He is disliked because he is hot-blooded and violent. He is instead the symbol of fear in war; unlike Athena, who is also portrayed as the goddess of war, and who acts with wisdom and protects the weak. Even though Ares has an enormous amount of strength, he is quickly overthrown by other gods. His strength is not physical. Rather, he needs weapons and his helmet to fight (Hamilton, 1998, p. 35-36). Hermes is the Greek god of travelers, sports, literature, world crossings, trade, thieves, and travelers. He has great speed, and for this reason, he is the messenger of the gods. Hermes is a trickster and enjoys playing jokes on gods and humans. He is able to travel between the divine world and the mortal world; he also guides the lost souls to the underworld and takes them there (Hamilton, 1998, p. 34). Tulkas is a combination of these two Greek gods. The strength of Ares can be related to the strength of Tulkas, even though Tulkas' strength is a bit different because it is more physical strength. Their personalities are different too. Tulkas, unlike Ares, is not bad-tempered; it takes some time to make him lose his temper, as mentioned earlier. He is more patient than

the Greek god Ares. Tulkas possesses Hermes like speed, and like him, he does not need any form of tool to move around. Those are the two things that Tulkas has in common with Ares and Hermes. He, just like Hermes, is the god of war, even though he is an improved version of him, and he has the light speed of Hermes. Therefore, those two gods are strong comparisons to Tulkas.

Nessa is Tulkas' wife and Orome's sister. She does not possess a significant amount of strength, but is the lady of speed and dance. She has a tremendous amount of speed and loves to be among fast animals, especially deers, and they would follow her and run with her when they saw her. She enjoys dancing in nature (Tolkien, 1999). Nessa is a mixture of Hermes because of his speed, and the Greek muse Terpsichore. Hermes' characteristics are analyzed in the previous part of this chapter, and he is a very fast god. As for Terpsichore, she is one of the nine muses in Greek mythology and is the muse of dance and song (Hamilton, 1998, p. 40). Nessa shares the attributes of haste with the Greek god Hermes and the skills of dance with the Greek muse Terpsichore. Therefore, these two Greek characters are the most fitting in describing Nessa.

In conclusion, this chapter demonstrates how Tolkien is inspired by Greek mythology during the creation of the Ainur. In Greek mythology, there are 13 Olympian gods, but in *The Silmarillion*, there are 14 Ainur. If Melkor is included, there are 15 of them. The similarity does not lie in the number of the deities, nor entirely in their characteristics. Each Ainu is analyzed individually and is matched with its equivalent from Greek mythology. None of the Ainur share the same characteristics and attributes of their equivalents from Greek mythology. No matter how many similarities there are between them, the Ainur are still different from the Greek mythological characters. The Ainur still have their unique attributes that differentiate them from the characters of Greek mythology. This can support that they are not exact copies of the Greek gods, goddesses, muses, and spirits, but, rather, are inspired by some of their characteristics. *The Silmarillion* and the Ainur are not based solely on any mythology, not even Greek mythology. *The Silmarillion* constitutes a mythology of its own, with some inspiration from the ancient Greek myths, which stand for the primary world that we live in, whereas *The Silmarillion* is the secondary world. That is to say, the world in *The Silmarillion*, which is Middle-earth, can be associated with the shadows of the objects in Plato's cave.

VI. CONCLUSION

This chapter highlights the findings of this thesis. Although, the mentioned chapters harbor many examples on the debate to draw a line in parallel to the research questions in this final conclusion part some snippets of each example will be reevaluated and emphasized to highlight the findings. As mentioned in the introduction, the aim is to find the meaning of logos by juxtaposing the primary world with the secondary world. All the inspirations Tolkien had such as the inspirations from Greek mythology are considered to be the primary world, because they are part of history. Whereas, Middle-earth in *The Silmarillion* is designed to be the secondary world. On account of this, similarities between the primary and the secondary world are found within his work. Moreover, music also plays a significant role. The relationship of music to the creation process of Middle-earth is analyzed. In the secondary world which is Middle-earth, the creation process would not have happened without music. Considering that in the primary world we have the existence of the music of the spheres, which has been investigated by Pythagoras and confirmed by modern scientists. Furthermore, music is also present in Abrahamic religions. These sources also claim that in the creation of the universe music has a great role. Another aspect is the connection between the Ainur and Greek mythology. To show the inspiration that lies behind their attributes, and to confirm that, although Tolkien was influenced by Greek mythology, the Ainur have many peculiar aspects as well. All in all, there are two philosophical components, Heraclitus' logos and Pythagoras' music of the spheres, both of which combined with Greek mythology in order to clarify the forming of an imaginary world called Middle-earth. The outcome of *The Silmarillion* is a world that is colorfully gathered by logos and the music of the spheres, with inspiration from Greek mythology. *The Silmarillion* is the bible of *Lord of the Rings* and *The Hobbit*. It is the beginning of history, the beginning of the world, and the beginning of a whole Tolkien's universe. Even though *The Silmarillion* was published after *The Lord of the Rings* and *The Hobbit*, it serves as an encyclopedia to the world of Tolkien for a deeper understanding of how

everything was born and how everything came to be.

Heraclitus states that; “To the God all things are beautiful and good and just, but men understand some things as unjust and some as just” (Brann, 2011, p. 102). This may demonstrate how Ilúvatar sees everything as just, how the creation process unfolded, how every Ainu gets only a part of his mind that is exposed to them, and also how Melkor was excluded because of his behavior. To Melkor, things were not fair. This is how he thinks, because everyone was against him. He didn’t blame his own actions or characteristics, but blamed others and found what was happening was unjust.

The Ainur thought that they were placing their personal taste into the creation of Middle-earth, but because they are born as an offspring of Ilúvatar’s mind, this means that what they are creating is a fraction of what is in Ilúvatar’s mind. He imagined the world in that way, and they were the instruments to bring Middle-earth to life. The thoughts of Ilúvatar are what is common to them. It confirms why they were born, and the knowledge they have to create the world in which they reside. Here, it may even suggest that there might be a probability that Ilúvatar can be considered to be a form logos, because he is the core and he is the offspring of the birth of everything. In the creation of Middle-earth, the music of the Ainur is also logos, because it is a form of speech. Additionally, the unison of the Ainur is logos, because they listen to each other in order to understand and to become united. Logos is not only a speaker, but also a listener, as mentioned above. Therefore, the Ainur listening to each other is a form of logos. The strife that happened during the creation process, the musical war, a war of oppositions between the Ainur and Melkor, is also logos. As stated by Heraclitus, “...all things come to pass through the compulsion of strife” (Balto, 2006). Logos consists of oppositions; those oppositions together form a united logos. Because of the contradictions, the creation of Middle-earth became possible. All of these different aspects can be regarded as logos. The influence of logos in the creation of Middle-earth is very strong, especially because of the aspect of how this world was created, which is through strife between good and evil. The struggle between light and dark is an ongoing theme throughout *The Silmarillion*, especially after the destruction of the two trees, which were the source of light. As quoted in Veryl Flieger’s *Splintered Light*;

“The gathering dark is broken intermittently by flashes of light, some vivid, some dim but seeming brighter by contrast with the surrounding dark. Light and dark are now established polarities of existence, each deriving meaning from the other, each giving meaning to the struggle that is human life. The struggle becomes the focus of the story. The action centers on the elven kingdom of Middle-earth ...” (Flieger, 2002, p. 119).

This states how the struggle between light and dark exists throughout *The Silmarillion*. It is one of the main themes and one of the bigger forms of strife and contradiction. It is a vivid analysis of how the light came into the dark, even though it was very dim, it was present to break the darkness that fell after the destruction of the two trees. It explains in a beautiful way how the light and the dark completed each other and were the source of existence. This entire analysis leads back to logos, and how logos as two things that are contradictory become one, as well as how logos is created out of strife. Consequently, logos has a vast impact on *The Silmarillion* as a whole, not only in the creation process of Middle-earth. Designed to meet the needs of the existence and the protection of Middle-earth, contradictions and oppositions are the main tools to keep this imaginary world alive.

Another crucial theme throughout *The Silmarillion* is music, especially because it is the main tool during the forging process. The music of the Ainur was the source of the creation of Middle-earth. Even Melkor’s dark discord aids in the forming process. Music not only plays a part in the conception process alone, but also in different aspects and chapters in *The Silmarillion*. After Melkor destroys the two lamps and brings darkness upon Middle-earth, “... Yavana sat there long upon the green grass and sang a song of power, in which was set all her thoughts of things that grow in the earth” (Tolkien, 1999, p. 31). Yavana’s song brought the two trees to life, which became the only source of light. She poured her sadness, worries and sorrow into her song, and through her song, the two trees started to grow. The other Ainur were silent as they listened to Yavana’s song and witnessed the growth of the two trees. “And as they watched, upon the mound there came forth two slender shoots; and silence was all over the world in that hour, nor was there any other sound save the chanting of Yavanna” (Tolkien, 1999, p. 31). Throughout the silence, nothing was audible except for Yavanna’s song, which brought to life the only source of light after the destruction of the lamps. Her song, and her feelings were the

reason those trees came to life and lit up the world one more time. This example illustrates that music is an evident theme throughout *The Silmarillion*, and it also demonstrates its importance in the creation of harmony. Harmony is needed for the world to exist in unity. Heraclitus and Pythagoras both talk about the term Harmonia, and in order to reach Harmonia in Heraclitus' view, contradictions are needed. Pythagoras' Harmonia occurs when an octave is filled with tones and notes that are both high and low. From this perspective, harmony is not only a term used in music, but also in philosophy, to describe a sense of completeness. Pythagoras applied his newly found law of harmonic intervals to all of the phenomena of nature, even going so far as to demonstrate the harmonic relationship between the planets, constellations, and elements (Rejimon, 2017, p. 180). This demonstrates that Pythagoras used harmonic intervals for different reasons.

The analysis of each Ainu in the previous chapter, with the linkage to their Greek equivalent, demonstrates how Tolkien was inspired by Greek myths. Each of the Ainur has an equivalent Greek god, goddess, or muse. Some of the Ainur are a mixture of multiple Greek mythological characters. Even though there are similarities, there are also many differences between the Ainur and the Greek gods. Tolkien didn't build his characters as an exact copy of Greek mythology. Rather, he added his own ideas to them and changed some of their attributes. Tolkien himself confesses that he was inspired by Greek mythology, and the following passage confirms that Greek mythology had an even greater impact on Tolkien. Tolkien acknowledged this debt to the Greek language and mythology in his letters. In 1956, he wrote to an unidentified Mr. Thompson: "I made the discovery that 'legends' depend on the language to which they belong; but a living language depends equally on the 'legends' which it conveys by tradition" (Drout, 2006, p. 258). Here, in Tolkien's words, it is seen how Greek mythology has an impact on the creation of *The Silmarillion*. He says the legends depend on their language, and this may serve as an explanation of why Tolkien created multiple languages in his works. The Greek language is an old language that has survived and is still used, so the Greek mythologies are strong due to the language in which they were written.

Consequently, the forming of Middle-earth is different than other creation stories. It is an imaginary world that is built on two different aspects of Greek philosophy, which are Heraclitus' logos and Pythagoras' music of the spheres. The

combination of those two philosophical concepts, combined with the harmony of music and Greek mythology, made it possible for a world to be created and filled with different colors. Tolkien's secondary world is an imaginary world created by the author. Here Tolkien became the creator of his own world, which has elements of the primary world that he lives in. In other words, the secondary world is unique and different from the primary world, but has visible traces of the primary world. Tolkien confirms that Middle-earth is an imaginary world where fantasy is used with the impression "which combines with its older and higher use as an equivalent of imagination the derived notions of 'unreality' —that is, of unlikeness to the primary world— of freedom from the domination of observed 'fact,' in short of the fantastic." (J.R.R. Tolkien, "On Fairy Stories") The contradictions that lead Middle-earth to a harmonious state, the strife during the creation, and the attributes of each Ainu make a colorful painting of a fantasy world that has become a myth of its own. *The Silmarillion* is the main source of understanding the background of other works by Tolkien. It is the Bible of the fantastic world of *The Lord of the Rings* and *The Hobbit*. *The Silmarillion* is the first foundational stone of a world filled with philosophy, mythology, music, and light versus dark. Tolkien gives the reader the authorization to interpret his secondary world Middle-earth where a diverse Prime Being and Sub deities exist the way she/he wants. His imaginary world after all is literature and not plain history.

VII. REFERENCES

BOOKS

- ASHBY, M. (2011). *African Religion Vol. 3 - Memphite Theology*. Sema Institute/Cruzian Mystic Book Publishing
- BRANN, E. (2011) *The Logos of Heraclitus*. Paul Dry Books.
- DROUT, M. D. C. (2006) *J.R.R. Tolkien Encyclopedia*. Routledge.(edited)
- FAUVEL, J., FLOOD, R., & WILSON, R. (2003). *Music and Mathematics from Pythagoras to Fractals*. Oxford University Press.
- FLIEGER, V. (2002). *Splintered Light: Logos and Language in Tolkien's World*. Kent State University Press, Revised Edition.
- FOSTER, R. (2001). *The Complete Guide to Middle-Earth: From the Hobbit Through the Lord of the Rings and Beyond*. Del Rey Books.
- GRAVES, R. (1955). *The Greek Myths*. The Complete and Definitive Edition. Penguin Books: New York.
- HAMILTON, E. (1942). *Mythology*. Little, Brown and Company: New York.
- HERMAN, A. (2004). *To Think Like God. Pythagoras and Parmenides, The Origins of Philosophy*. Published by: Parmenides: United States of America.
- HILLAR, M. (2012). *From Logos to Trinity. The Evolution of Religious Beliefs from Pythagoras to Tertullian*. Cambridge University Press.
- HOMER, FAGLES, R., KNOX, B. (1999) *The Odyssey*. Penguin Classics.
- JANSSEN, H. (2020). *Stoicism: Logos, the Golden Rule, and Stoic Philosophers*. Efalon Acies.
- LLOYD-JONES, H. (2004). *Geoffrey Stephen Kirk 1921–2003*. The British Academy PDF.

- OVID, & HUMPHRIES, R. (1971). *Ovid: Metamorphoses*. Indiana University Press.
- SCHIAPPA, E. (2003). *Protagoras and Logos: A Study in Greek Philosophy and Rhetoric (Studies in Rhetoric/Communication)*. University of South Carolina Press.
- SELIGMAN, P. (1975). *The apeiron of Anaximander; a study in the origin and function of metaphysical ideas*. Greenwood Press.
- SNYDER, C. (2013). *The Making of Middle-earth: A New Look Inside the World of J.R.R. Tolkien*. Sterling.
- TOLKIEN, J. R. R. (1999). *The Silmarillion*. Christopher Tolkien Edition. Published by: HarperCollins: London.
- TOLKIEN, J. R. R. (2015). *The Book of the Lost Tales*. Part One. Christopher Tolkien Edition. Published by: HarperCollins: London.
- TOLKIEN, J. R. R. (1979) *The Silmarillion. The Epic History of the Elves in the Lord of the Rings*. Ballantine. Tolkien, J. R. R. (2004) *The Lord of the Rings: 50th Anniversary Edition*. Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.
- TOLKIEN, J. R. R., Carpenter, H. Tolkien, C. (1981). *The Letters of J.R.R. Tolkien*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin. Tolkien, J. R. R. (2004) *The Lord of the Rings: 50th Anniversary Edition*. Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.
- TOLKIEN, J. R. R. (2004) *The Lord of the Rings: 50th Anniversary Edition*. Houghton Mifflin Harcourt.
- TYMIENIECKA A. T. (2006) *Logos of Pheonomology and Pheonomology of the Logos. Book Five. The Creative Logos. Aesthetic Ciphering in Five Arts, Literature and Aesthetics*. Springer, Hanover: USA.
- WORTHING, M. W. (2016). *Narnia, Middle-earth and the kingdom of God: a history of fantasy literature and the Christian tradition*. Wipf & Stock.

ARTICLES

BENNETT, V. (1945). Thoughts from Pythagoras. *Music & Letters*, Vol. 26, No. 4.
Published by: Oxford University Press.

BLACKSTONE, L. (2011) *Remixing The Music of The Spheres: Listening to The Relevance of an Ancient Doctrine for the Sociology of Music*.
<http://jstor.org>. <http://about.jstor.org/terms>

REAMES, R. (2013). *The Logos Paradox: Heraclitus, Material Language, and Rhetoric*. *Philosophy & Rhetoric*, Vol. 46, No. 3.

ZOELLER, G. (1991). *Taking Music Philosophically*. *The Iowa Review*, Vol. 21, No. 3. Published by: University of Iowa.

JOURNALS

BALTO, M. (2006) ISSN 1393-614X *Minerva - An Internet Journal of Philosophy* 10 (2006): 123-136 Mark Balto 123 Logos As Will And Cosmodicy
Mark Balto. <http://www.minerva.mic.ul.ie/vol10/Logos.pdf>

Journal of the Indian Council of Philosophical Research. (2001). Synthetic Reason and Aesthetic Order. *Adapted from Synthetic Reason, Aesthetic Order, and the Grammar of Virtue*.
<http://www.webpages.uidaho.edu/ngier/srao.htm>

MOTION, F. (2006). Astro Black Morphologies: Music and Science Lovers. *Leonardo*, 39(1), 23-29. Viewed August 11, 2021, from
<http://www.jstor.org/stable/20206146>

REJIMON, P. K. (2017) The Relevance of Western Philosophers Theories of Music
<http://www.ijiras.com/2017/Vol 4-Issue 5/paper 37.pdf>

WEBSITES

- BENT, I. D. (2021) *Musical Notation*. <https://www.britannica.com/art/musical-notation> viewed on 17 May 2021
- BIBLE. (1995). *Trumpet*. <https://bible.knowing-jesus.com/topics/Trumpet> viewed on 10 January 2021
- BUTLER-BOWDON, T. (2013). *Heraclitus and the Birth of the Logos*. <https://modernstoicism.com/heraclitus-and-the-birth-of-the-logos/> viewed on 10 July 2020
- CARTWRIGHT, M. (2013) https://www.worldhistory.org/Greek_Music/ viewed on 21 March 2021
- dictionary.com. (2021). *Logos*. <https://www.dictionary.com/browse/logos?s=t> viewed on 07 July 2019
- greekgodsandgoddesses.net. (2010). *Antheia – Goddess of gardens, flowers, swamps, and marshes*. <https://greekgodsandgoddesses.net/goddesses/antheia-goddess-of-gardens-flowers-swamps-and-marshes/> viewed on 01 December 2020
- greekgodsandgoddesses.net. (2010). *Oizys – Goddess of Grief, Anxiety, and Depression*. <https://greekgodsandgoddesses.net/goddesses/oizys-goddess-of-grief-anxiety-and-depression/> viewed on 29 November 2020
- HAMMOND, G. W. (2020). *J.R.R. Tolkien English author*. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/J-R-R-Tolkien> viewed on 12 June 2020
- Masterclass.com staff. (2019). *Music 101: What Is Harmony and How Is It Used in Music?* <https://www.masterclass.com/articles/music-101-what-is-harmony-and-how-is-it-used-in-music#quiz-0> viewed on September 2020
- PAPAGIANNIS, D. (2019) *Thessaly and Medicine From Ancient Greek Mythology to Contemporary Times: A Perpetual Relationship*. <https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/31847001/> Viewed on 10 January 2021
- Quran. (2021). *Trumpet*. <http://www.islamicity.org/quransearch/?q=trumpet>"amicity.org/quransear

[ch/?q=trumpet](#) viewed on 10 January 2021

Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. (2019). *Heraclitus*.

<https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/heraclitus/> viewed on 15 August 2020

Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy. (2018). *Pythagoras*.

<https://plato.stanford.edu/entries/pythagoras/> viewed on 15 August 2020

The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica. (2021). *Empedocles Greek Philosopher and Scholar*. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/Empedocles> viewed on 15 August 2020

The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica. (2019). *Heraclitus Greek philosopher*.

<http://www.britannica.com/biography/Heraclitus> viewed on 15 August 2020

The Editors of Encyclopaedia Britannica. (2021). *Pythagoras Greek philosopher and mathematician*.

<http://www.britannica.com/biography/Pythagoras> viewed on 15 August 2020.

theoi.com. (2017). *Akhlys* <https://www.theoi.com/Daimon/Akhlys.html> viewed on 01 December 2020.

theoi.com. (2017). *Eleos*.

<http://www.theoi.com/Daimon/Eleos.html> viewed on 10 February 2021.

theoi.com. (2017). *Penthos*.

[https://www.theoi.com/Daimon/Penthos.html#:~:text=PENTHOS%20was%20the%20personified%20spirit,amongst%20the%20Algea%20\(Sorrows\)](https://www.theoi.com/Daimon/Penthos.html#:~:text=PENTHOS%20was%20the%20personified%20spirit,amongst%20the%20Algea%20(Sorrows)) viewed on 10 February 2021.

Torah. (2021). *Trumpet*. [http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/decoding-the-shofar/"ofar/](http://www.myjewishlearning.com/article/decoding-the-shofar/) viewed on 10 January 2021.

WESTMAN, S. R. (2021). *Johannes Kepler German Astronomer*.

<http://www.britannica.com/biography/Johannes-Kepler> viewed on 28 November 2020.

RESUME

Name Surname: Sara Hilal Sedeeq

Education:

Istanbul Aydın University - Istanbul, Turkey Masters Degree in English Literature, Class of 2019

Thesis: From Logos to Middle Earth: The Musical Theory in Tolkien's Silmarillion

Ishik University - Iraq One year English Language education in C1 first in rank

Lebanese French University - Iraq BA in English Language & Literature, Class of

2017 Thesis: Agatha Christie's Life and Work: A Comparison Between the East and

the West French Institute - Iraq B1 level in French Nahren High School for Girls -

Iraq Third place in class, Class of 2012 Senefelder Schule Treuchtlingen - Germany

High School up to 9th grade in German Language Grundschule Truechtlingen -

Germany Primary School in German language

Work Experience:

Team Coordinator Ayef Global Solutions | Jun 2021 - Present Team Leader / Patient

Coordinator Medicine Hospital | Feb 2021 – May 2021 Koberg and Partner Financial

Advisor | Nov 2020 – Feb 2021 EFL/ESL Instructor English Castle | Oct 2018 –

Present English Lecturer Istanbul Aydın University | Jun 2018 - Jun 2019 EFL/ESL

Instructor Various Language Schools | Jan 2018 - Oct 2018 EFL/ESL & German

Language Instructor American Cultural Association | Nov 2017 - May 2018

Languages:

English (native)

German (native)

Arabic (native) French (good)

Turkish (very good)

Skills:

- Certified TOEFL Trainer by IBT Propell - Able to work efficiently under pressure -
Able to make quick decisions and solve problems - Able to work in a team - Able to
give teacher training - Able to plan, organize, and prioritize work -